

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL

JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 23rd January 2020

PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS – CATEGORY I

19-20/19 Attendance and apologies

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A.

The Chair welcomed the Committee and thanked all for attending. The Chair informed the Committee that Dr Colette Conroy had left the University of Hull and acknowledged her contribution to the Committee. Dr Lesley Morrell will replace Dr Conroy as a representative of Hull's Education Committee. The Chair also thanked Professor Julie Jomeen, Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences for her contributions to HYMS and HJSC, as she too will be leaving the University of Hull.

19-20/20 Minutes 31 October 2019

The minutes of the meeting held on 31st October 2019 (enclosure HJSC.19-20.16) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

19-20/21 Matters arising

The Committee received a list of matters arising (HJSC.19-20.17). It was **noted** that:

a) Re M19-20/03.c – The Chair of Board of Studies provided a verbal update on the establishment of a working group to examine the issues of student representation in detail and to highlight the value to the student experience overall of the social and academic experience membership of the Students' Unions can provide. The Committee was informed that the Chair of Board of Studies had met the presidents of the separate Hull and York medical societies and the sub-society presidents to

discuss the value of a unified process. The Chair of Board of Studies had also corresponded with HUU, GSA and YUSU and intended to facilitate a meeting of all. The Committee **noted** that the issues include questions of identity of student bodies as of the medical school (inclusive of all HYMS students) or medical students' society (inclusive only of MB BS students) given the more diverse School population. It would also be pertinent to consider the merits of a single governance structure reporting to the two Universities unions for efficiency, but cognisant of complex due diligence obligations. There are also challenges of retaining links with medical students in years three to five who are primarily in clinical placements and of the diverse and particular characteristics of the postgraduate community, many of whom are studying alongside their professional work.

During the discussion, it was suggested that the Students' Union 'Presidents of Activities' should be included in the discussions alongside their academic colleagues, as the issues pertain to non-academic elements of the Union links and representation as well as the academic, particularly given the complexities resulting from disciplinary issues and the need to ensure parity and fairness of treatment in the 'One School' ethos. Further, it was **noted** that a new Code on Student Representation for HYMS is under development and would need to relate to the range of HYMS student societies issue and forms of course representation, ensuring the right relationships with the Unions throughout the School's structures. The Committee requested an update on this worthwhile and vital work at its next meeting.

Action: Chair BoS

b) Re M19-20/03.d – The Committee **noted** that the University of York Council approved the recommendations of the HYMS Governance Review at its meeting 11 November 2019. The University of Hull Council also approved the recommendations at its meeting 26 November 2019.

c) Re M19-20/03.e – The Committee was provided with a verbal update on the proposals for Annualised Clinical Placements, following consultations with University colleagues. The Committee was informed that the Universities' views were that the School's marketing materials provide only general information about placements that would not impact upon the ability to make changes to placements affecting current MB BS students and applicants. Further, the Chief Operating Officer was working with NHS trust partners to ensure student accommodation and other practical concerns were addressed before a final full proposal would be submitted by the Board of Studies for HJSC Chair's Action approval as soon as possible. It was **noted** that the proposal preferred was as previously submitted, but that this would likely also require provisions for bespoke reconfigurations to some extent for partner trusts to account for local circumstances.

Action: Chair BoS

d) Re M19-20/11.b – The Chair of Board of Studies provided a verbal update on the formulation of a Postgraduate Taught Experience Survey (PTES) response rate action plan, which was requested to

ensure the response rate achieved in the 2020 PTES (to be managed by the University of York) exceeds the minimum reporting threshold. The Committee was informed that the Acting Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board will undertake this activity until the permanent Chair is in place. The Committee requested that a report summarising the plan implemented be submitted to the next HJSC meeting.

Action: Chair BoS

19-20/22 To receive an oral report from the student representatives

a) The President of Education, HUU had no issues to raise.

b) The Academic Officer, YUSU informed the Committee that a survey of all HYMS students as part of the evidence-gathering process for the forthcoming periodic review (see M19-20/26), led by YUSU on behalf of and in liaison with HUU, GSA and the Student Staff Committee, was live and that the response rate was very low. The intended survey period had been extended in anticipation of further responses being made. The School informed the Committee it had supported the promotion of the survey, but that it was concerned that it did not discourage or distract students from the National Student Survey (NSS) that would open on the 3rd February, PTES or PRES. A further reminder would be sent to all students about the periodic review survey.

The YUSU Academic Officer also offered to assist the School with its NSS promotion as required.

c) The VP Academic, GSA had no issues to raise.

d) The Chair of the Student Staff Committee had no issues to raise.

19-20/23 To receive a written report from the Dean of HYMS

a) The Dean introduced her report (HJSC.19-20.18) and drew the Committee's attention to:

- i. Recent staff appointments and vacancies, including the arrival on 1st February of Dr Matthew Morgan, University of Birmingham as Deputy Dean and of other appointments as part of the School's expansion. This included a number of research appointments at York.
- ii. Her recent appointment as Acting Dean of Faculty at Hull on Professor Jomeen's departure following discussions with both Vice-Chancellors to ensure any impact on the medical school will be limited, to be further mitigated by Dr Morgan's arrival as Deputy Dean.
- iii. The need to renew the HYMS strategy for which the Committee's guidance and direction would be appreciated on what the strategy might include. The strategy renewal would also be timely as the Universities have/ are undertaking similar processes. Discussion of the strategy would be included on the agenda for the next meeting.

iv. Transformation activity underway at the University of Hull includes HYMS, leading to work in HYMS' strategic planning group to ensure no negative impact on students, and through high level discussions to ensure no impact on York from Hull's decisions.

b) During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. The School is monitoring the national context for the MSc in Physician Associate Studies as changes in NHS labour marketing planning mean Physician's Associates are being utilised in different ways, with further changes likely. The core aim remains to make a positive difference to NHS staffing. The School intends to plan targets carefully due to the adverse impacts on the programme team if there is significant yearly change in student numbers in terms of the delivery of teaching and placements. Further, the national Physician's Associate professional registration plans and discussions about prescribing responsibilities have not progressed, impacting on providers' abilities to organise effective programmes. It was also unclear whether the Government's apparent decision to reintroduce bursaries for some health and allied professions students would include Physician Associates. The diversity in the sector of Physician Associate programme delivery, 'ownership' across university departments and lack of consistency in the focus of training towards jobs in a defined NHS role and pay grade also needs national evaluation to clarify for providers how training should be best undertaken.
- ii. It could be useful for the School to assess mega-trends and undertake horizon scanning activity for planning future provision, for example the implications of the digitalisation of health care. Relevant to which is a College of Physicians project along such lines, of which the Chair of Board of Studies has been involved.
- iii. Detailed discussions with the MSc in Human Anatomy and Evolution programme team are considering the degree's future, including a recognised need for market research. It was reiterated that individual modules from this programme are popular with students from several others, including those in the York Department of Archaeology, and are offered in liaison with them. Proposals about the programme would be submitted to HJSC in due course.
- iv. Postgraduate research student numbers had been included in the report, which showed the majority are based at Hull. There were some concerns about the level of MD programme non-completion rates, which were attributed to the particular student context whereby students often undertake the degree as career development whilst remaining in work or on a career break, with even strong students finding it challenging to balance competing professional, personal and academic commitments. This raised questions of the availability of suitable support for MD students, including support for the transition into postgraduate research, to structure the data generating and writing up stages of their projects and then the transition back into their professional roles. The Postgraduate Programme Board would explore these issues further and the Committee's offers of support were welcomed. Other relevant issues to explore could include the students' perceptions of the value of the qualification versus the publications generated by their research on their career development, and the potential of promoting the benefit of undertaking postgraduate study to early career professionals rather

than the MD being viewed as a later career activity that might then more often compete with significant other commitments.

- v. The NSS reference group had met without the inclusion of current MB BS students, with the intention to invite recent graduates to a future meeting. This was because of a concern not to inappropriately influence current students' response to the NSS 2020. It was perceived that more value lay in engaging with postgraduate students that had undertaken the HYMS MB BS and other alumni for their recent insights. The School had also accepted a recent invitation to join Hull's NSS Steering Group and the Secretary of Board of Studies would join the Group.

19-20/24 To consider revised wording of Term of Reference 10 following consultation of the membership and advice from University Equality and Diversity Offices (M18-19/05.a refers)

The Secretary introduced a paper proposing revised wording of term of reference 10 following consultation of the membership and advice from University Equality and Diversity Offices (M18-19/05.a refers) (HJSC.19-20.19). The paper proposed revising the term to: *"To ensure that teaching, learning and assessment practices promote equality of opportunity, diversity and inclusivity, with appropriate regard for fitness to practise and fitness to study requirements"*. To remove any linguistic ambiguity, the Committee instead **approved** *"To ensure that teaching, learning and assessment practices promote diversity, inclusivity, and equality of opportunity, with appropriate regard for fitness to practise and fitness to study requirements"*.

The Committee **noted** that following the introduction of the new governance structures and pending revised ways of working that might result from the revision to the Memorandum of Agreement, the Secretary would arrange both Senates' approvals of the revised Term. Additionally, that the ability for HJSC to make amendments to its membership and Terms of Reference would be discussed between the Chair and Deputy Chair of HJSC and School and University colleagues as part of the discussions about the revised Memorandum.

Action: Secretary

19-20/25 To discuss the Annual Programme Review Report prepared by HYMS and submitted to the University of York (including updated MB BS and postgraduate action plans for 2019-20)

The Chair of Board of Studies introduced the discussion of the Annual Programme Review Report prepared by HYMS and submitted to the University of York (including updated MB BS and Postgraduate action plans for 2019-20) (HJSC.19-20.20a-c). The Committee **noted** the Secretary of Board of Studies' work to consult stakeholders and the Head of Quality and Standards' contribution to the final edit. The Report summarised and collated reflections on all undergraduate and postgraduate programmes and drew upon varied sources of data and student experience feedback.

During the discussion it was **noted**:

- i. Professor Finn's National Teaching Fellow Award for which congratulations were due.
- ii. Enhancements to Phase I learning outcomes and the reduction in failure to progress, though the Applied Life Sciences (ALS) failure rate appeared to remain high. It was proffered that this was due to the volume and difficulty of learning within ALS compared to other Phase I blocks. Further, learning outcomes were revised to better focus learning within the broad curriculum that could overwhelm students, and in the context of Problem-Based Learning that aims to open students' minds to varied topics. It was felt that more direction and structure would better support students to progress.
- iii. That regarding student engagement, the GSA could assist with activities in the context of York's wider student engagement projects. Also, that new staff in HYMS and an increased capacity should enable staff to interact more with students, encouraging greater informal contact, that would enable concerns and questions to be raised more frequently and informally. Additionally, the redesign of the York building facilitated these more frequent informal interactions that the School was keen to replicate across sites. The recently-appointed Student Engagement and Alumni Officer was also working on a strategy to communicate and engage with students to more clearly and consistently structure opportunities for student feedback.
- iv. An additional possibility to promote staff and student interactions on placements was to enhance student visibility, perhaps by introducing a uniform so clinical staff may then become more conscious of students' presence and how to best include and support their learning.
- v. The graduate employability section of the Annual Programme Review Report focused on employment outcomes rather than how employability skills are embedded to support such outcomes for undergraduate and postgraduate students. In the context of the Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF), it was suggested that in future it would be essential to explain persuasively how the School promotes employability in programmes and what feedback it then compiles to evaluate the effectiveness of such initiatives. For example, any Foundation School feedback on how well prepared HYMS graduates are for their further training.
- vi. Concerns to safeguard and monitor the postgraduate research student experience to balance the growth of the MB BS programme without compromising the effective management of the research programmes and spaces available for research students.
- vii. Curriculum developments to postgraduate taught programmes were underway and to be proposed in two phases. The School was advised to discuss modifications with the Academic Quality teams to establish the levels of approvals needed.

Action: Chair BoS

19-20/26 To receive a note of plans for the Periodic Review of HYMS' learning and teaching provision to be led by the University of York on Thursday 30 April 2020

The Secretary introduced a paper outlining the plans for the Periodic Review of HYMS' learning and teaching provision to be led by the University of York on Thursday 30 April 2020 (HJSC.19-20.21). The Committee **noted**:

- the intended purpose of the review;

- the membership of the internal panel, to be chaired by Dr Steve King, Associate Dean for Teaching, Learning & Students, Sciences Faculty, York;
- that the School had proposed two external panel members and that the Chair of HJSC would consider the suitability of these nominations in due course;
- that a survey of all HYMS students had been circulated in order that a student submission could be prepared by YUSU in collaboration with the GSA, HUU and the Chair of the Student Staff Committee. The resulting report would be an important source of documentary evidence guiding the panel's assessment of issues to discuss with students and staff on the day and so the survey would benefit from as high a participation rate as possible.

An update on the preparations for periodic review would be provided at the next HJSC meeting.

Action: Secretary

19-20/27 To discuss and provide feedback on a draft revisions to the MB BS Phase II Scholarship and Special Interest Programme (SSIP)

The Chair of Board of Studies introduced a proposal to revise the MB BS Phase II Scholarship and Special Interest Programme (SSIP), including the Quality Improvement Project (QIP) (HJSC.19-20.22), explaining that the Board of Studies would welcome the Committee's feedback on the draft proposals to assist its preparation and consideration of a final proposal for implementation in the 2020-21 academic year for third year students (current year two students) and 2021-22 for when that cohort enters year four. The Chair of Board of Studies explained that the proposals relating to the student selected element of years three and four of the programme were being proposed following poor student feedback, difficulties managing the SSIP administration in its current form and a need to plan a manageable SSIP component for the expanded MB BS cohort.

During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. In the table on page 9 of the proposal included a formatting error suggesting missing information about the QIP.
- ii. The proposal included a lot of support for students, but that enhanced staff support, for example for marking and moderation would be needed and the Committee was reassured this would be in place, linked to wider efforts in the School to boost tutor training. Also systems developments and the use of OpenCampus would enable SSIP progress reporting and monitoring to help ensure student work is undertaken incrementally through the SSIP.
- iii. Hull's project on assessment rubrics could provide insight to enhance the quality of the marking and moderation.
- iv. The changes would mean summative assessment at the end of the SSIP only, but that there is potential value in a staged approach to provide students and tutors with a sense of student progress. The School is beginning to consider the benefits of programmatic assessment, for example through portfolios that could have ongoing formative value as well as providing an end of component summative assessment. The revised SSIP would be a step towards a more

programmatic approach with formative assessment potential, balanced with the encouragement of supported and monitored self-directed learning. Further, there is a concern to reduce the overall assessment and work burden within the MB BS programme.

- v. Students had been consulted on the proposals to date and had been broadly supportive.
- vi. As a change to a core programme component, a consultation was required with all current students to be affected (current year one and two students), which should be in the form an email to all such students, alongside explanations in suitable face-to-face forums. As the proposed change would have a neutral or advantageous impact on students, the Chair HJSC advised that non-responses could be regarded as consent to the changes and that she would consider by Chair's Action the final proposals in the light of the student feedback.

Action: Chair BoS

19-20/28 To consider a revised *Policy on Mitigating and Exceptional Circumstances Affecting Assessment and Examination*

The Deputy Chair of Exceptional Circumstances Committee attended to speak to this item, along with the Chair of Board of Studies. A revised *Policy on Mitigating and Exceptional Circumstances Affecting Assessment and Examination* was introduced (HJSC.19-20.23a-c) following consultation with student and staff stakeholders within HYMS and with colleagues in the two universities.

a) The Committee **noted** that:

- i. Changes to include defined Mitigating Circumstances would allow for the consideration of a wider range of pertinent issues affecting students' performance in assessments and follow University of Hull practices. The name of the responsible sub-committee of the Board of Examiners would also be changed to reflect the new emphasis.
- ii. A significant change proposed was to reduce from a total of 20 days the submission deadline for claims for mitigating and exceptional circumstances to five working days and a total of 10 working days for submission of claims and supporting evidence, or before the Board of Examiners ratification of results, whichever was soonest. This would allow the Board of Examiners meetings to align with term dates and remove the need for release of unratified results, enabling students to progress to the next year with ratified results.
- iii. The revised policy would be implemented from the start of the 2020-21 academic year, but early approval was ideal so that the schedule of summative assessments and Board of Examiners meetings could be finalised to increase the ability to ratify results and progression decisions in the most timely manner for students' benefit. This should reduce the numbers of students progressed at risk due to outstanding applications.
- iv. A further significant proposal was for extension requests for less than five working days that are supported by evidence to be automatically approved by the Mitigating and Exceptional Circumstances Committee without the need for ratification by the Board of Examiners (under devolved powers).

- v. The terminology relating to application decisions would be changed to supported/ not supported from accepted/ rejected to reflect a perception of the policy as one concerned with student wellbeing.
- vi. There had been extensive consultation with students and staff. Student consultation had supported the reduction of the time period in which claims and evidence could be submitted to a total of 10 working days and the wider policy proposals.
- vii. The *Policy on Mitigating Circumstances etc.* should be viewed in the context of the reasonable adjustments policy, which remains under review and would be proposed at the March Board of Studies meeting before being submitted for HJSC approval.

The Committee **approved** the proposal on the condition that:

- i. The example provided in section 3.8 should more clearly state rejection of the application for being outside of the stated time frame and what that time frame was. The example should also refer to the potential for students to appeal decisions ratified by the Board of Examiners through inclusion of a signpost to the relevant section (7.5).
- ii. The position of examples in the document should be reviewed to ensure they most appropriately align with the section they explain.

Action: Chair BoS

Once amendments had been made the Committee was content for the Policy to be published at the intended time without need for confirmatory review.

19-20/29 To discuss the Annual Report on Academic Misconduct in the School

The Chair of the Board of Studies introduced the *Annual Report on Academic Misconduct Cases for 2018-19* (HJSC.19-20.24). The Committee **noted** that in the academic year 2018-19, three academic misconduct concerns were investigated, all concerning postgraduate taught students and each case related to an individual student. The three cases concerned suspected plagiarism and were determined by a panel hearing. The panels recommended in each cases that the affected work receive a mark of 0 and where a resit of the assessment was allowed, the module mark was capped at 50.

During the discussion, the Committee **noted** the School is already enhancing its use of Turnitin for tutors and students so that inappropriate text use can be better understood, identified and addressed. It was also **noted** that it is important students are informed of resources available to them, but that it is then their responsibility to behaviour appropriately. It was further suggested that the School could consider including on mark coversheets a question asking if students were aware of/ had used Turnitin, to highlight the importance of academic integrity and resources to promote it.

19-20/30 Dates of meetings in 2019-20

The Committee **noted** the revised dates for the remaining meetings of the academic year:

- Monday 20 April 2020, 10:00-12:00, AMS/225 York, York/ 1st Floor Meeting Room Loxley, Hull;
- Tuesday 30 June 2020, 15:00-17:00, AMS/225 York, York/ 1st Floor Meeting Room Loxley, Hull.

ANNEX A: Attendees of the Unreserved Agenda

Members

Professor Rebecca Huxley-Binns (Chair, PVC Hull)
Dr Sarah-Louise Jones (Senate, Hull)
Mr Colin Johnson (Education Committee, Hull)
Miss Hannah Mullins (Chair, Student Staff Committee, HYMS)
Professor Martin Veysey (Chair of Board of Studies and MB BS Programme Director, HYMS)
Dr Jacquie White (Senate, Hull)
Professor Stephen Smith (Senate, York)
Dr Barry Lee (Teaching Committee, York)
Professor Una Macleod (Dean, HYMS)
Professor Gabrielle Finn (Acting Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board, HYMS)
Miss Giang Nguyen (Academic Officer, YUSU)* - from M19-20/22
Miss Hannah Mullins (Chair Student Staff Committee, HYMS)*
Miss Jane Baston (Vice President Academic, Graduate Students' Association)*
Mr Orduen Nguper Simeon (President Education, HUU)*

In attendance

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)
Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)
Mr Daryl Butcher (CEO, York Graduate Students' Association, Observer)
Dr Victoria Allgar (Dep. Chair of the Exceptional Circumstances Committee, HYMS) – for M19-20/28

Apologies

Professor John Robinson (Deputy Chair, PVC York)
Mrs Lisa Tees (Academic Quality Manager, Hull)
Professor Neil Lunt (Senate, York)
Professor Tracy Lightfoot (Teaching Committee, York)
Dr Lesley Morrell (Education Committee, Hull)
Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)
Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)

Members marked with a * do not attend for reserved business.