

**UNIVERSITY OF HULL  
UNIVERSITY OF YORK**

**HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL**

**JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting held on 1<sup>st</sup> May 2019

**PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS**

**18-19/44 ATTENDANCE AND APOLOGIES**

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A.

The Chair welcomed the Committee and thanked them for attending this extra meeting scheduled at short notice following the inquorate meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> April. Apologies for absence were also **noted**.

**18-19/45 TO DISCUSS THE ANNUAL REPORT OF ADMISSIONS TO THE MB BS COURSE**

The MB BS Admissions Tutor attended the meeting to present the *Annual Report of Admissions to the MB BS Course* (HJSC.18-19.30) for the 2017-18 recruitment cycle leading to entry into the programme in 2018-19. The Committee **received** the report and was informed that the 2017-18 recruitment cycle had led to enrolments to target in a quite challenging recruitment context of expansion in the sector. During the discussion, the Committee **noted** that the School:

- Has achieved very positive results recruiting students from diverse backgrounds, particularly regarding socio-economic measures, and that the School should be congratulated for securing an intake broadly mirroring that of the wider University sector rather than the more homogeneous medical school sector.
- Remains committed to attracting students with a range of social characteristics and to offering widening participation activities planned carefully to maintain a competitive, high-tariff offer attractive to the broader market.
- Has close links with a number of the Universities' recruitment and widening participation projects and that it would also be part of York's new contextual offer scheme.
- Has an 'assist to interview' initiative to support fair access to the competitive admissions process and that the new Gateway to Medicine programme further adds to this agenda.
- Continues to monitor the impact of its campus allocation policy on conversion rates due to applicants' preferences for an early allocation to inform their offer acceptance decision.
- Had identified action points for the current recruitment cycle from the 2017-18 experience to maximise conversion rates.

- Was yet to receive the most recent figures for Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic students from the Medical Schools Council and offered to work to source as up to date data as is available for the next annual report to the Committee.

**Action: Dean**

- Admits certain applicants with advanced standing onto the MB BS, for example dentists, and in particular circumstances, though the *Code of Practice on Admissions to the MB BS Course* makes no reference to this. The School **agreed** to amend the Code to make the potential for such admissions explicit.

**Action: Dean**

## **18-19/46 MINUTES 24<sup>th</sup> January 2019 and 17<sup>th</sup> April 2019**

a) The minutes of the meeting held on 24<sup>th</sup> January 2019 (enclosure HJSC.18-19.31) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting, subject to amendment of M18-19.24.b.ii regarding the HUU President Education's report of feedback to her of students' concerns about the HYMS appeals process. The minute was amended to better reflect the comments. The Committee also requested an update from the HUU President Education on any discussions she had had with the Appeals Administrator.

**Action: HUU President Education**

*Secretary's Note: The HUU President Education clarified after the meeting that the HUU Advice Centre had mentioned potential issues from their experience working with students going through the HYMS appeal process. No more detailed response was provided before the HUU President Education left office.*

b) The minutes of the meeting held on 17<sup>th</sup> April 2019 (enclosure HJSC.18-19.31a) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

## **18-19/47 MATTERS ARISING**

The Committee **received** a list of matters arising (HJSC.18-19.32). It was **noted** that:

a) Re M18-19/22e (and M18-19/05) – The Secretary of the Joint Board clarified after the January HJSC meeting that the Joint Board meeting 10 December 2018 did not approve amendments to HJSC terms of reference 10 and 15. Instead, it requested a review of the terms as part of the wider governance review being led by the Dean and with whom the Chair HJSC is liaising to fulfil the Joint Board's request (see also M18-19/25b)ii below).

b) Re M18-19/24b)i – The HUU President Education provided a written update in absentia with regard to the vacancies of HYMS Subject (formerly School) Representative and of the intention to introduce a HYMS Part-time Officer. It was **noted** that a part-time officer had been recruited, but since resigned and so the post and that of Subject Representative were vacant. A wider review was also taking place of academic representation on HUU executive. The Committee asked that it receive an update from the HUU President Education at its next meeting.

## Action: HUU President Education

During discussion of this item, the Chair of Student-Staff Committee raised some concern about the role description for the HUU part-time officer. He explained that the main concern is that HUU has sought to recruit the Officer from the full HYMS student body, not from the pool of course representatives and that such a person could have a limited relationship or less established communication channels with HYMS representatives and committees. As the Officer would represent and raise current issues at the HUU Education Zone and Council it is felt important they have a good knowledge of current issues. The Chair SSC also **noted** that none of the HYMS representatives had been interested in the position. He explained that his concerns had already been raised, and that the student body is having ongoing discussion within the School and with both Students' Unions to resolve the issue of representation within the unions.

c) Re M18-19/25b)ii – Related to M18-19/22e (above) regarding the wider review of HJSC terms of reference, the Joint Board requested that a review be undertaken of the OfS quality and standards conditions for registration (B1-B5). The Secretary HJSC and the HYMS Academic Programmes Manager provided a mapping of how the governance of HYMS' learning and teaching is overseen and ensures compliance with the conditions, including noting the lines of reporting to the Universities' governing bodies and highlighting any compliance risks or gaps in processes. The Dean **reported** that this was discussed by a recent meeting with the York Registrar and Secretary and that it was not thought that any further action was needed at this stage, though some action to address minor points identified might be necessary in due course.

d) Re M18-19/26 – The Chair of Board of Studies reported, with regard to the requested review of the *Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals* that the Appeals Code (and *Code of Practice on Investigation and Determination of Student Complaints*) will be reviewed reflecting on experience from the past year and feedback received. As the opportunity to consider these changes with staff and students in the January/February meetings of School committees was missed, these will be submitted for the June Board of Studies meeting and HJSC in July 2019.

e) Re M18-19/27 – The Chair of Board of Studies reported, with regard to the implementation of the *Code of Practice on Fitness to Study* that the final revisions of the Code were undertaken and that the Code has now been implemented.

f) Re M18-19/28 – Following the January HJSC meeting, non-HYMS HJSC members were invited to provide comment on the Annual Programme Review (APR) report for HYMS for the year 2017-18. The Chair collated the comments received and forwarded them to the Chair of Board of Studies for consideration of any actions to be taken. The Chair of Board of Studies reported that Programme Board Chairs had considered the feedback but that there were no additional actions taken to report at this stage.

g) Re M18-19/30 – The Chair of the Board of Studies reported that the MB BS Action Plan for 2018-19 was being progressed and in consideration of HJSC's feedback, and that the Postgraduate Action Plan was also being progressed and had been amended to provide more specific timelines.

h) Re M18-19/32 – The Chair of HJSC had reviewed responses from the Chair of the HYMS Ethics Committee and feedback from Hull's Ethics Committee to HJSC's comments on the Annual Report of the HYMS Ethics Committee and determined that no further action is required.

**18-19/48 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A LIST OF CHAIR'S ACTIONS SINCE THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Committee **received** a list of Chair's Action approvals (HJSC.18-19.33) since the last meeting. The Chair **approved** revisions to the Gateway Year to Medicine programme *Clinical Skills* module to correct an error in the breakdown of hours of learning in the version of the module approved.

The Chair also **approved** the appointment of Nikki Davies, Head of Operations in Registry Services at the University of Hull, as Investigating Officer for appeal cases involving Hull-registered HYMS students, and in accordance with the Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals (section 12). The appointment follows the resignation from the role of Tom McCreedy. The Committee **noted** with thanks Dr McCreedy's contribution to the role over a number of years.

**18-19/49 TO RECEIVE AN ORAL REPORT FROM THE STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES**

a) The Chair of the Staff-Student Committee (SSC) **reported** that he had been working with the Students' Unions and members of the SSC to resolve issues as they have arisen. He **reported** that the School had a full complement of representatives and that relations between student representatives and staff had been positive during the year thus far.

b) The YUSU Academic Officer **reported** that they had been unsuccessful in recruiting a HYMS Department Representative and that this role would be advertised again in the autumn. It was felt desirable to have a Department Representative, but it was also acknowledged that it can be challenging for HYMS students to be available to attend Union business and that maintaining good relations with the SSC and student representatives in the School was sufficient. The Academic Officer also suggested that School representatives have been successful in raising and resolving students concerns without requiring the Union's additional support.

The Academic Officer also **reported** that he had not yet been able to progress discussions with the Chair of SSC and HUU President Education about extra costs to HMS students for such as travel to placements, but remained committed to exploring this issue further.

c) The GSA Vice-president Academic had no issues to report to the Committee.

**18-19/50 TO DISCUSS A WRITTEN REPORT FROM THE DEAN**

a) The Dean introduced her report (HJSC.18-19.34a-c) and drew the Committee's attention to:

- i. The positive experiences and data relating to the MB BS admissions cycle thus far for 2019-20 entry suggesting recruitment would be to target;
- ii. The expected introduction by the General Medical Council (GMC) of a Medical Licensing Assessment (MLA) from 2022-23 as a significant national change in medical education;
- iii. The activities underway to prepare for the School's expansion, particularly developments of the physical estate at York and the governance arrangements of the medical school.

b) During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. The continued policy for MB BS admissions would consider carefully the appropriate tariff to ensure HYMS is an attractive first choice institution to applicants, while providing opportunities for students with barriers to entry through consideration of contextual offers.
- ii. That postgraduate taught applications outlined in the report were encouraging, including for the new MSc in Pharmacology and Drug Development and buoyed by scholarship offers funded by the University of Hull. It was added that HYMS scholarships are also available across masters provision, but that if further funding were available, including from the University of York, this could help attract more postgraduate applicants.
- iii. That the introduction of the MLA as an external, national assessment is proving challenging for some medical schools with more traditional programmes, but that HYMS already has experience of integrating such assessments, for example the National Prescribing Assessment, into its MB BS award in a similar way to that proposed for the MLA. Also, it should be less difficult for the School to make the necessary arrangements to integrate the scheme as the proposed MLA assessments are similar to the assessment approach the School uses in its final year curriculum. The School stated it will take the necessary steps to align the curriculum to prepare students, as further details about the MLA are confirmed.
- iv. The expansion work to redesign the York building is progressing with activities underway to decant the School at York around Alcuin College. The Dean acknowledged the capital investment committed by York's University Council to facilitate the developments. The Dean also **reported** that the governance review is progressing to develop proposals for the best governance model for the more mature, larger school and that proposals would be shared with HJSC at a later date.

**18-19/51 TO CONSIDER PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE MB BS PROGRAMME SPECIFICATION FOR 2019-20, TO INCLUDE APPROVAL TO PILOT A LONGITUDINAL INTEGRATED CLERKSHIP**

The Committee **considered** amendments to the MB BS programme specification for 2019-20 (HJSC.18-19.35) that updated key information and included reference to the Gateway to Medicine programme. Additionally, the proposals included a request to introduce, as a small-scale pilot for 2019-20, a year 4 Longitudinal Integrated Clerkship (LIC) with the intention of rolling out the LIC further, if successful, from 2020-21. It was **noted** that the LIC is an innovative approach to placement learning, but one used already in a small number of UK medical schools and internationally. The Committee **discussed** the LIC and was assured that sufficient student support would be in place and monitored closely.

The Committee **agreed** the proposed programme specification subject to a number of minor amendments being made, and signed-off by the Chair HJSC. The Secretary had forwarded these

to the Chair of Board of Studies. Amendments were also required to the admissions criteria in section 10 to explain more fully the A-Level requirements, and to include reference to progression from the Gateway programme.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**18-19/52 TO CONSIDER PROPOSED REVISIONS TO THE REGULATIONS FOR THE DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF MEDICINE, BACHELOR OF SURGERY (MB BS)**

The Committee **considered** proposed revisions to the *Regulations for the Degree of Bachelor of Medicine, Bachelor of Surgery (MB BS)* (HJSC.18-19.36) particularly to incorporate the Gateway to Medicine programme, update terminology, account for minor changes of policy or practice and remove unnecessary information. The Committee **approved** the Regulations subject to a number of minor amendments being made, and signed-off by the Chair HJSC. The Secretary had forwarded these to the Chair of Board of Studies.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**18-19/53 TO CONSIDER PROPOSED REVISIONS TO THE CODE OF PRACTICE ON ASSESSMENT AND EXAMINATION FOR MB BS PARTICULARLY TO INCORPORATE THE MB BS GATEWAY YEAR AND CHANGES TO THE SCHOLARSHIP AND SPECIAL INTEREST PROGRAMMES (SSIP)**

The Committee **considered** proposed revisions to the *Code of Practice on Assessment and Examination for MB BS* (HJSC.18-19.37a-c) particularly to incorporate the MB BS Gateway Year, and changes to the Scholarship and Special Interest Programmes (SSIP) and its summative assessment. The Committee **noted** that the changes to the SSIP were to accommodate larger numbers of students and to provide a more appropriate assessment regime, reducing the number of summative assessment components in each year's SSIP. The Committee **discussed** whether there would be increased risks of failure by removing component assessments and in not having a clear formative assessment in the same format as the summative method. The Committee was reassured that students would have more time to prepare their single summative assessments and that, though not formatively assessed, there would be appropriate opportunities for students to receive formative feedback on draft work. This was regarded as good practice and the Committee **noted** the low failure rate of the SSIP currently. The proposal was **approved** subject to a number of minor amendments being made, and signed-off by the Chair HJSC. The Secretary had forwarded these to the Chair of Board of Studies.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**18-19/54 TO CONSIDER PROPOSED REVISIONS TO THE REGULATIONS FOR TAUGHT POSTGRADUATE CERTIFICATES, POSTGRADUATE DIPLOMAS AND MASTER'S DEGREES**

The Committee **considered** proposed revisions to the *Regulations for Taught Postgraduate Certificates, Postgraduate Diplomas and Master's Degrees* (HJSC.18-19.38) particularly to the application of Recognition of Prior Learning and Credit Transfer, to accommodate the greater range of postgraduate programmes now offered, to clarify compensation arrangements, to revise the processes for confirming marks and awards, and to reflect other changes to policy and process. The Committee **discussed** the appropriateness of the minimum marks required in Independent Study Modules to qualify for merit or distinction awards, which appeared lower than would be expected at the University of York and that did not appear to give sufficient weight to the research project component of the programme to achieve such recognition. The Committee requested an explanation as to why the rule was as stated. Further, the Committee suggested that the wording of paragraph 10.1 was ambiguous and should be rephrased to more clearly express the intended meaning. The proposal was **approved** subject to receipt of clarification about merit and distinction marks, the rephrasing of paragraph 10.1 and a number of minor amendments being made, and signed-off by the Chair HJSC. The Secretary had forwarded minor amendments to the Chair of Board of Studies.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**18-19/55 TO DISCUSS PGT EXTERNAL EXAMINERS RESPONSES**

The Committee **discussed** the School's responses to the summary of issues arising from the postgraduate taught external examiners' reports for 2017-18, as highlighted by the Academic Support Office at York during the annual review of reports (HJSC.18-19.39a-c). The Committee **noted** the work of the Chair of the Postgraduate Board of Examiners to prepare the report and the responses provided to the external examiners, in collaboration with Programme Leaders. The Committee also **noted** the positive feedback and good practice examiners recorded. The Committee **discussed** the report on Clinical Anatomy and requested further clarification on how the issues of concern had been addressed. It requested that a revised report is submitted to the July HJSC meeting, and if necessary, in an alternative format that more clearly explains how the respective concerns have been addressed.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**18-19/56 TO DISCUSS THE RESULTS OF THE PILOT QUALITATIVE PROGRAMME DIRECTORS MB BS SURVEY**

The Committee **received** the results of the pilot qualitative Programme Director's MB BS Survey (HJSC.18-19.40) that sought to generate MB BS students' feedback on the broad domains of the National Student Survey, to highlight programme strengths and any concerns for timely actions. In the MB BS Programme Director's absence, the Committee registered its thanks and **noted** his work and the value gained from undertaking the survey. However, the Committee also **noted** the limited conclusions that could be drawn due to the low response rate.

**18-19/57 TO RECEIVE THE REPORT ANNUAL MONITORING VISITS 2018-19: SUMMARY OF ACTIVITY, OUTCOMES AND FUTURE PLANS AND A VERBAL UPDATE ON THE MEDICAL SCHOOLS ANNUAL RETURN SUBMITTED TO THE GMC**

The Committee **received** the report *Annual Monitoring Visits 2018-19: Summary of activity, outcomes and future plans* (HJSC.18-19.41). The Head of Quality and Standards **reported** that the visits to clinical placement partners had been valuable and that the strength of the student voice had helped persuade partners of actions they should take to improve the student experience. She also offered to share with HJSC an update that detailed examples of where student feedback had led to changes, and which was shared with the Student-Staff Committee.

The Deputy Chair HJSC suggested that the School should keep a record of such student voice activities and outcomes to use in future subject-level Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) submissions, as TEF panels had closely scrutinised claims about the influence of the student voice.

It was also suggested that the School and departments at York could explore how to communicate the outcomes of their monitoring activities with mutual partners to share good practice and any concerns. The Dean and Professor Lightfoot offered to **discuss** this activity outside the meeting.

**Action: Dean**

The Committee also **received** a verbal update from the Head of Quality and Standards on the GMC's feedback on the Medical Schools Annual Return (MSAR). It **noted** that the MSAR was an increasingly less onerous exercise for the School to complete and that the GMC provided only brief feedback. This year it did not raise any concerns or request any actions.

**18-19/58 DATES OF MEETINGS IN 2018-19 AND DATES FOR 2019-20**

Dates of remaining meetings for 2018-19

- **Thursday 25th July 2019 10.00am-12.00pm, York room TBC/** 1st floor meeting room Loxley Building Hull

Dates of meetings for 2019-20 (all rooms TBC)

- Thursday 31 October 2019 10:00-12:00;
- Thursday 23 January 2020 10:00-12:00;
- Wednesday 22 April 2020 10:00-12:00;
- Wednesday 1 July 2020 10:00-12:00.

**ANNEX A: Attendees of the Unreserved Category I Agenda**

**Members**

Professor John Robinson (Chair, PVC York)

Professor Rebecca Huxley-Binns (Deputy Chair, PVC Hull)

Professor Neil Lunt (Senate, York)  
Dr Sarah-Louise Jones (Senate, Hull)  
Professor Stephen Smith (Senate, York)  
Professor Tracy Lightfoot (Teaching Committee, York)  
Mr Colin Johnson (Teaching Committee, Hull)  
Professor Una Macleod (Dean, HYMS)  
Dr Sam Cobb (Chair Board of Studies, HYMS)  
Dr Julie Seymour (Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board, HYMS)  
Mr James Hare (Academic Officer, YUSU)\*  
Mr Vassili Crispi (Chair Student Staff Committee, HYMS)\*  
Ms Charlotte Chamberlain (Vice President Academic, Graduate Students' Association)\*

**In attendance:**

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)  
Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)  
Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)  
Ms Lynne Braham (Deputy Director Academic Partnerships, Hull)  
Dr Paul Docherty (MB BS Admissions Tutor, HYMS) – *for Item 2 (M18-19/45 only)*

**Apologies**

Professor Martin Veysey (MB BS Programme Director, HYMS)  
Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)  
Miss Isobel Hall (President Education, HUU)\*  
Ms Osaro Otobo (President of the Union HUU)\*  
Dr Jacquie White (Senate, Hull)  
Dr Colette Conroy (Teaching Committee, Hull)  
Dr Barry Lee (Teaching Committee, York)  
Mrs Lisa Tees (Academic Quality Manager, Hull)  
Professor Julie Jomeen (Dean of Faculty of Health Sciences, Hull)  
Professor Brian Fulton (Dean of Faculty – Sciences, York)

Members marked with a \* do not attend for reserved business.