

**UNIVERSITY OF HULL
UNIVERSITY OF YORK**

HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL

JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE

Unreserved Minutes of the meeting held on 25th July 2018

PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS

17-18/35 APOLOGIES AND ATTENDANCE

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A.

The Chair welcomed the Committee, including new members, and received apologies for absence.

The Chair also reminded the Committee that this would be the first occasion on which the HJSC Reserved agenda would be considered as Category II business with assumed approval of the reserved papers circulated to non-student HJSC members, unless any such member requested in advance that they be discussed (M17-18/33 refers). As no such request was made, the reserved items were **approved** and minuted to be available to appropriate Committee members and the Universities.

17-18/36 MINUTES 24th January 2018

The minutes of the meeting held on 24th January 2018 (enclosure HJSC.17-18.27) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

17-18/37 MATTERS ARISING

It was **noted** that M17-18/20.d referred to the previous HUU Education Officer's report he was to survey HYMS students at Hull about their broad perception of HUU, beyond issues of academic representation, but that this had not taken place. The incumbent HUU President, Education expressed her willingness to conduct such a survey and she would liaise with colleagues to consider this activity further.

17-18/38 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A LIST OF CHAIR'S ACTIONS SINCE THE PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee **received** a list of Chair's Action approvals (HJSC.17-18.28) since the last meeting:

- a) The Chair **approved** as an exceptional request due to the impact of industrial action, a revision to the term two assessment of the MBBS Phase I Scholarship and Special Interest Project (SSIP). The modification removed the requirement for students to undertake an oral

poster presentation which would require double marking. The element would be replaced with the need to submit slides of the presentation accompanied by a script or notes as the student would have presented, along with the poster. The marking criteria would also be amended to remove the element specifically covering oral presentation and question and answer component.

- b) The Chair **approved** as an exceptional request due to the impact of industrial action, a revision to the assessment of the Functional and Musculoskeletal Anatomy (FMA) module of the MSc in Human Anatomy and Evolution. The modification delayed the formal presentation (task 1) until 19th April (week 1 of the summer term) and the oral examination viva (task 2) until 25th April (week 2 of the summer term). The modification was approved on the basis that the ability to present the complex information and course content and to discuss it in the viva were regarded as the most suitable way in which to assess the achievement of the module learning outcomes.
- c) The Chair **approved** minor amendments to the following Codes of Practice at the request of the Board of Studies:
- Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals;
 - Code of Practice on Investigation and Determination of Student Complaints;
 - Code of Practice on Fitness to Practise.
- The revised Codes will be effective from 1st August 2018.
- d) The Chair **approved** the Board of Studies' request to amend its membership to reflect recent changes in leadership roles within the School. Also to amend the quoracy such that for unreserved business the quoracy is to include at least one student member in attendance.
- e) The Chair **approved** the Board of Studies' request to amend the *Regulations of the Degree of MB BS* specific to students registered on the Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences) such that students successfully completing the Dip HE and that met the English language requirements of the MBBS could progress to year 3/ Phase II of the MBBS. This change in regulation was by addition of an addendum to the Regulations and amendment to the Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences) programme specification. The addendum is also to be time-restricted and effective from the academic year 2018-19 until all students registered on the Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences) have completed their programme. The Addendum states: "Students that have successfully completed the Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences) and meet the English language requirements for the MBBS may progress into year 3 of the MBBS."

In regards to a) and b) above, the Chair BoS reported that the alternative assessments as a consequence of industrial action had been implemented smoothly and that students had fed back that they appreciated the advice and information they had received on the matter.

17-18/39 TO CONSIDER MATTERS RAISED BY STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

The YUSU Academic Officer informed the Committee of a planned YUSU Officers' visit to Hull to discuss how the Unions might best work with the HYMS student body.

The HUU President, Education and YUSU Academic Officer both **reported** that having a HYMS Subject Co-ordinator (HUU)/ Department Rep (YUSU) during the last year had worked well in connecting the Unions and the School.

The GSA Vice President **reported** that two HYMS PGR students had applied for funding to organise a conference on making the transition from academic research to industry which had led to a successful event.

The Acting Chair of the Student-Staff Committee **reported** that a new Subject Co-ordinator/ Departmental Rep would be elected appointed in due course, as would the new Chair SSC.

17-18/40 TO RECEIVE A WRITTEN REPORT FROM THE DEAN

a) The Dean introduced her report (HJSC.17-18.29) and drew the Committee's attention to:

- i. The most recent teaching and professional services staff appointments;
- ii. The progress of student recruitment for under-graduate and postgraduate 2018-19 entry;
- iii. The implementation of new branding and marketing initiatives and further related plans;
- iv. The experience of undergraduate and postgraduate programme delivery during 2017-18;
- v. The ongoing work to implement the School expansion plan following receipt of additional medical training places, and including business systems developments to support teaching and learning and plans for the development of the Academy of Primary Care.

b) During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. HYMS was given the largest number of additional medical training places of medical schools bidding to HEFCE/Office for Students and that this expansion would be the most significant transformation of the Hull York Medical School since its founding and likely for a considerable time to come. The expansion project is being led by the Chief Operating Officer with contributions from a number of senior colleagues.
- ii. The development of the Academy of Primary Care was a significant demonstration in the expansion bid of HYMS' commitment to primary care within the region and that this would further HYMS' long-standing focus on providing training and clinicians in the field.
- iii. Recent appointments to York and Hull appeared to be balanced towards Hull, which it was explained was both in order to redress the balance towards an equal distribution of staff at both Universities and accounted for jointly funded Hull (Institute for Clinical and Applied Health Research) and HYMS posts. It was also noted that though some posts were registered to Hull the staff would be involved in delivering teaching at both universities. Further academic appointments would follow as part of School expansion, supported by appropriate growth in the professional services staff. The Dean offered to provide the Committee with an overview of staffing in her report to the next meeting.

Action: Dean

- iv. As part of the development of the Academy of Primary Care and wider expansions, the School was reconsidering the most effective way in which to integrate Public Patient Involvement (PPI) into its work. It was suggested that a co-production model as adopted elsewhere at Hull was a more positive approach than more consultative approaches taken in the past. The Dean emphasised the School's commitment to PPI and explained that an expansion work-stream is exploring approaches to adopt.
- v. As part of the expansion plans the School is exploring partnership opportunities with the South Tees NHS Trust that could facilitate clinical placements in the Friarage Hospital, Northallerton and James Cook Hospital, Middlesbrough. This would be the first new major Trust partnership since the School's creation and the Committee queried how such a partnership might be approved. The Dean explained that the School intended to draw on the University of York's activities to develop a wider partnership between the Trust and the University which was being led by the PVC Research and Dean of the Faculty of Sciences. The Chair supported this development and suggested that the Joint Board be asked to give its view on what would be an appropriate approach to approving any eventual partnership to both universities' satisfaction.

Action: Secretary

- vi. The Dean's Report referred to the School's CPD provision and this raised a question of how the School oversees the governance and quality of such taught provision. The Committee was informed that the CPD sessions referred to were non-credit-bearing workshops provided to clinicians and clinical tutors and that any credit-bearing modules within programmes and available as CPD were subject to standard oversight processes. The Committee was satisfied with the response received.

17-18/41 TO CONSIDER THE GATEWAY YEAR COMPONENT (YEAR 1) OF A NEW MBBS IN MEDICINE (WITH A GATEWAY YEAR) PROGRAMME

The Committee **considered** a proposal for a six-year MBBS variant to include a Level 3, 120 credit modular Gateway Year (year 0) (HJSC.17-18.30). The full MBBS will be titled *MBBS in Medicine with a Gateway Year*, listed on UCAS as a separate *Medicine with a Gateway Year* entry route to the existing five-year MBBS programme. The programme would be full time and start in 2019/20.

The Gateway Year will be delivered at Hull. The year 0 will include some clinical placement activity. On joining the MBBS year one it is intended students will be able to choose which university they will be registered with, following the usual HYMS campus allocation policy.

The six-year MBBS programme is intended for a widening participation (WP) cohort with specific WP entrance criteria and a lower A-Level tariff, reflecting its Level 3 starting point. It will also give preference to applicants from the HYMS region. It is not intended to recruit international students, but will be open to EEA students. Students will have access to student finance for the full six years. Should students successfully complete the Gateway Year and decide not to progress to the MBBS year one they will be eligible for a jointly awarded Foundation Certificate in Higher Education (Pre-Medicine) exit award.

The Committee considered the Programme Specification and six new Module Descriptors, reports from two External Assessors with expertise delivering similar programmes, and a response by the Programme Team to the Externals' comments.

During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- Students successfully completing the Gateway Year and progressing to the existing MBBS would follow that programme as specified on that Programme Specification (see also M17-18/42).
- The General Medical Council have confirmed that they do not need to separately approve the Gateway Year programme or the six-year variant, as they already recognise HYMS as an approved training provider and as the existing accredited MBBS will not be altered.
- The Quality Support Officers (QSO) and Professional Services at both Universities have been involved in the development of the programme. The York QSO had provided comments to the Programme Team after the last Board of Studies meeting which with the Committee's approval the Team had agreed to incorporate into the programme documentation post-HJSC.
- Section 10 of the Programme Specification stated that "Students need to have a maximum 3-year gap between secondary education and starting at HYMS" which was felt to be ambiguous. It was confirmed that the programme is to be normally available only to those students with a maximum of three years since completion of initial secondary education (school leaving). It was further suggested that care-leavers can experience later competency in, and adaptation to, independent living than other young adults. Therefore to effectively support their transition onto the programme and longer-term progression, enabling applications from those care leavers of an older age could be appropriate. It was suggested that the wording in Section 10 be amended to "Students *normally* need to have a maximum 3-year gap between *leaving school* and starting at HYMS".
- The entrance criteria would be managed pragmatically to account for those applications that did not meet the standard criteria described, but that suggested the appropriate aptitude and abilities. This would include taking decisions, where places were available, to offer five-year MBBS places to any six-year programme applicants that achieved the higher A-Level grades for 'direct entry', and a place on the six-year programme to five-year programme applicants that did not obtain high enough grades and otherwise met the WP criteria for the six-year MBBS.
- The University of Hull has considerable experience in the delivery of Foundation Programmes and that this experience has demonstrated the challenges students can face successfully progressing through higher education programmes. It was suggested that recruitment of staff to deliver both the Level 3 academic content and to support the development of independent learning and study skills would be crucial.
- The financial costs of the programme could be considerable to the intended WP cohort and members of the Committee and an External Assessor questioned how students would be supported to meet the costs of the programme. The School explained that students would qualify for six years of financial support from Student Finance England, from bursaries and that they had secured scholarship funding which they were considering how best to allocate fairly, transparently and effectively. This consideration included if students should be provided with IT equipment.

The Committee **approved** the MBBS in Medicine with a Gateway Year six-year programme, the Gateway Year component and its composite modules and the exit award of Foundation Certificate in Higher Education (Pre-Medicine), subject to revisions of the documentation agreed outside of the

meeting with the Programme Team and the amendment to Section 10 outlined above. As a result of HJSC approval the programme can be advertised at the earliest opportunity.

17-18/42 TO CONSIDER REVISIONS TO THE MBBS PROGRAMME SPECIFICATION, UPDATED FOR ACCURACY AND FOR THE 2018-19 COHORT

The Committee **considered** the MBBS Programme Specification for 2018/19 (HJSC.17-18.31) following revisions to update information on learning outcomes, assessment and the subject content and timings of various blocks. The Committee **approved** the specification subject to revisions to Sections 15 and 23 to ensure they reflect that 'Outcomes for Graduates' is the latest GMC reference source.

17-18/43 TO CONSIDER A REVISED POLICY ON EXCEPTIONAL CIRCUMSTANCES AFFECTING ASSESSMENT AND EXAMINATION (FORMERLY MITIGATING CIRCUMSTANCES)

The Committee considered a revised *Policy on Exceptional Circumstances Affecting Assessment and Examination* (formerly Mitigating Circumstances), including revisions to the title and membership of the Exceptional Circumstances Committee (HJSC17.18.32). The proposal reflected a substantial revision of the previous policy and following thorough internal consultation and consultation with the Quality Support Officers and the York Special Cases Manager. The proposal included the designation of assessments as Clinical and Non-clinical Examinations and of the application of a Fit-to-Sit declaration by students undertaking the former.

During the discussion the Committee **noted** that the Secretary would provide a list of minor amendments to the Board of Studies for incorporation in the final version of the document. It was also suggested in the discussion that:

- YUSU, HUU and GSA advice and guidance services be mentioned and contact details added;
- Section 4.7 could be clearer as to what will happen if evidence cannot be submitted within 10 working days of the claim being submitted;
- Section 6, table p. 16 for 'Reluctance to disclose circumstances...' it was suggested that there might be good reason why students are reluctant, which the School recognised and said it already has ways to handle such instances. Therefore the table entry could be amended to reflect this;
- Section 6, table p. 17 section on Pregnancy could signpost the Universities' policies on pregnancy and maternity as it was noted HYMS does not have a separate such policy;
- Section 6, table p. 19 for Planned Health Appointments could be expanded to note that the School will consider cases where such appointments cannot be moved (eg. surgery);
- Section 7.7.3 the invigilator's report could be used as evidence for the Exceptional Circumstances claim and could therefore be referred to in 7.7.3, though in cases of more significant medical incident in an assessment further medical evidence might also be required;
- Section 7.8.1 should amend reference to fit-to-sit policy to 'fit-to-sit provisions that follow' to remove any suggestion there is a separate fit-to-sit policy document.

The Committee also discussed the extent to which students undertaking Clinical Examinations would be sufficiently equipped at the point of their first Clinical Examination to make a sound

judgement of their fitness to sit the assessment, and as a result of appropriate training to make such a personal reflection of fitness. The Committee was reassured that as a key feature of the MBBS is early clinical exposure students are actively supported from an early stage to understand the meaning of fitness-to-practise and of how to assess their fitness at a given point in time, such that it is reasonable to expect students to understand the implications of their fit-to-sit judgement. Further, as the Policy would apply to all HYMS students, those on the six-year MBBS Gateway Year would not be as experienced in fitness-to-practise/-sit issues and thus their assessments would not be classed as Clinical Examinations.

The Committee **approved** the Policy for implementation for the start of the 2018-19 academic year, subject to the revisions suggested above.

17-18/44 TO CONSIDER A CODE OF PRACTICE ON FITNESS TO STUDY

The Committee **considered** a new *Code of Practice on Fitness to Study* (HJSC17.18.33). The Committee was informed that the Policy was felt timely as both Universities now had Fitness to study Policies and the School had revised related policies and codes of practice, such that it is now appropriate for HYMS to have provision to manage challenging student cases not falling under existing process such as Fitness-to-Practise. The proposal had been aligned with the Universities' policies and adopted a similarly staged approach to managing circumstances, with the students' interests central to the process.

The Head of Quality and Standards confirmed that on review of the latest York policy, which was recently revised, the School's proposal remained appropriate.

During the discussion it was **noted** that under section 9.1.5 the Fitness to Study panel can recommend that the Board of Studies terminates a student's studies, which it was clarified would require HJSC approval. However, it was suggested that as the York policy allows only the Vice Chancellor to terminate the studies of/expel a student under such circumstances, that it would be pertinent to ensure that the provisions of the HYMS policy were appropriate in assuming (the Chair of) HJSC had the delegated authority of both Universities for such decisions. The Chair asked that the Secretary consult the Universities' Governance Officers on this issue.

Action: Secretary

It was also **noted** during the discussion that following approval of the *Code of Practice on Fitness to Study* that the *Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals* would require revision to facilitate the necessary appeal opportunities to be afforded to students.

Action: Chair BoS

The proposal was **approved** for implementation for the start of the 2018-19 academic year, subject to a number of amendments forwarded to the School by the Secretary and to the outcome of the consultation with the Governance Officers.

17-18/45 TO RECEIVE A VERBAL UPDATE ON THE HYMS SUBMISSION TO THE GMC OF THE MEDICAL SCHOOLS ANNUAL RETURN 2016/17 AND FEEDBACK RECEIVED FROM THE GMC

The Committee **received** a verbal update on the HYMS submission to the GMC of the Medical Schools Annual Return 2016/17 and feedback received from the GMC (HJSC.17-18.34). The Head of Quality and Standards in HYMS explained that, as in recent years, the GMC provided only minimal feedback to the School and on only specific points HYMS had raised in its report. It was **noted** that though the brief feedback provided only limited comment on the GMC's view of HYMS it also provided reassurance of the quality and standards the School maintains and of its proactive approach to monitoring areas of concern it highlighted to the regulator.

17-18/46 TO CONSIDER WHICH STUDENT SATISFACTION SURVEYS HYMS WILL PARTICIPATE IN DURING 2018-19

The Committee **considered** a paper tabled by the Secretary concerning HYMS' participation in student satisfaction surveys in 2018/19 (HJSC17-18.35). The Committee **noted** that in 2017/18 there had been some confusion as to in which postgraduate surveys the School would participate and of the University that would manage such participation. The paper recommended that, with the School's agreement HYMS would participate in the NSS, PTES and PRES surveys in 2018/19. Further, that York would manage the School's participation in the NSS and PRES as it would participate in these as an institution. It was also recommended that the School participate in PTES should Hull confirm its participation and consequently it would manage the School's involvement. The proposal was **approved** following confirmation from the Chair, Deputy Chair and colleagues in HYMS that this approach would be agreeable to all parties. The Secretary would communicate this decision to those colleagues involved in the administration of the surveys.

Action: Secretary

17-18/47 TO CONSIDER UPDATED UNDERGRADUATE AND POSTGRADUATE ACTION PLANS FOR 2017-18

The Committee **discussed** the most recent updates to the undergraduate and postgraduate action plans for 2017/18 (HJSC.17-18.36), referring also to details in the Dean's Report (HJSC.17-18.29).

- a) The Committee was particularly concerned to understand the extent to which the organisation and management of undergraduate clinical placements had been improved by the appointment of the Clinical Deans and their teams. The Committee was satisfied that, though on account of a number of pressures during the year progress had not been as extensive as desired, improvements had been made to the clinical placement experience which were continuing to be monitored and enhanced.
- b) The Committee was pleased to **note** that the majority of actions had been completed on the postgraduate plan, but it was disappointed that despite the previous Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board's efforts to engage with the postgraduate research students (PGR) to better understand poor PRES results relating to PGR community and student voice, this issue remained. The Committee suggested this issue was one of shared responsibility that would only

be solved with the active support of the PGR cohort, proffering that the start of a new academic year with a new Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board could offer a fresh opportunity to resolve this issue.

17-18/48 VALEDICTIONS TO RETIRING MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

The Chair thanked those members of the Committee present and in absentia that had/would be retiring from the Committee with the conclusion of the academic year:

- Professor Alan Speight (Deputy Chair, Hull);
- Mr Julian Porch (YUSU);
- Mr Salman Anwar (HUU);
- Ms Emmily Nonas (Chair SSC, HYMS);
- Dr Claire Hookham-Williams (Hull);
- Dr Jan Hardman (York);
- Professor Martin Chalkley (York);
- Dr Katherine Selby (York);
- Dr Roger Sturmeay (HYMS).

17-18/49 DATES OF MEETINGS IN 2018-19

Dates for the meetings in 2018-19

- Wednesday 24th October 2018, 10.00am-12.00pm, Meeting Room 223 HYMS York/ 1st floor meeting room Loxley Building Hull
- **Thursday** 24th January 2019, 10.00am-12pm, Meeting Room 223 HYMS York/ 1st floor meeting room Loxley Building Hull
- Wednesday 17th April 2019, 2.00-4.00pm, Meeting Room 223 HYMS York/ **2nd floor** meeting room Loxley Building Hull
- **Thursday** 25th July 2019 10.00am-12.00pm, Meeting Room 223 HYMS York/ 1st floor meeting room Loxley Building Hull

ANNEX A: Attendance

Members

Professor John Robinson (Chair, PVC York)

Professor Glenn Burgess (Deputy Chair, DVC Hull)

Professor Una Macleod (Dean, HYMS)

Dr Sam Cobb (Chair Board of Studies, HYMS)

Dr Jacquie White (Hull Senate representative)

Dr Claire Hookham-Williams (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)

Mr Colin Johnson (Hull Teaching Committee)

Professor Neil Lunt (York Senate representative)

Mr James Hare (Academic Officer, YUSU)

Mr Vassili Crispi (School Representative, HUU and Acting Chair Student Staff Committee, HYMS)

Miss Isobel Hall (President, Education, HUU)

Mrs Fatma Layas (VP Wellbeing and Communities, Graduate Students' Association)

In attendance:

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)

Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)

Dr Jason Boland (Programme Leader of MBBS Gateway Year and Chair of Exceptional Circumstances Committee, HYMS)

Mr Martin Gregson (Academic Support Officer, HYMS)

Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)

Mrs Lisa Tees (Quality Team, Hull)

Ms Lynne Braham (Deputy Director Academic Partnerships, Hull)

Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)

Apologies

Professor Brian Fulton (Dean of Faculty – Sciences, York)

Miss Emmily Nonas (Chair Student Staff Committee, HYMS)

Dr Jan Hardman (York University Teaching Committee representative)

Dr Sarah-Louise Jones (Hull Senate representative)

Dr Julie Seymour (Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board, HYMS)

Professor Martin Chalkley (York Senate representative)

Professor Julie Jomeen (Dean of Faculty of Health Sciences, Hull)

Dr Katherine Selby (York Teaching Committee representative)

Ms Charlotte Chamberlain (President, Graduate Students' Association)

Members marked with a * do not attend for reserved business.