

**UNIVERSITY OF HULL  
UNIVERSITY OF YORK**

**HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL**

**JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting held on 26<sup>th</sup> July 2017

**PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS**

**16-17/53 APOLOGIES AND ATTENDANCE**

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A

- a) The Chair welcomed members, including those new to the Committee, and received apologies for absence.
- b) The Chair **noted** that HJSC does not have a quoracy requirement and that considering introducing one might be a point for consideration during handover discussions with Professor Robinson when he takes the Chair in the next academic year.

**16-17/54 MINUTES 4<sup>th</sup> MAY 2017**

The minutes of the meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> May 2017 (enclosure 1) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting, with one amendment:

*16-17/42.b.v* – amended to “...Furthermore, it was suggested that the Chair asks the Joint Board to consider and advise on this issue to ensure that top-level university governance requirements would be met by any particular individually or jointly considered collaboration...”.

The Chair will contact the Joint Board to ask that they discuss the processes for approval of collaborative provision at their meeting in October 2017.

**Action: Chair HJSC**

**16-17/55 MATTERS ARISING**

The Committee **received** a list of matters arising (enclosure 2). It was **noted** that:

- a) the action M16-17/37 on the Secretary HJSC to ensure the HJSC membership was reviewed for 2017/18 would be undertaken during handover discussions between the Chair and Deputy Chair.
- b) the action M16-17/40 on the Dean of HYMS to raise with the Joint Board the need to ensure appropriate processes for oversight of research activity was outstanding due to the postponement until October 2017 of the Joint Board when this issue could be raised.
- c) M16-17/44/e was addressed later in the meeting as part of the Dean’s Report (M16-17/58) refers.

d) regarding M16-17/47, the Chair had reviewed the very brief feedback the School had received from the GMC on the Medical School's Annual Return with no substance or concerns to report.

#### **16-17/56 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A LIST OF CHAIR'S ACTIONS SINCE THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Committee **received** a list of Chair's Actions approvals (enclosure 3) since the last meeting:

a) It was **noted** that the Chair had **approved** amendments requested by HJSC at its meeting 5<sup>th</sup> May 2017 to revise the *Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals*.

b) The Committee also **discussed** the Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) and **noted** that HYMS was not included in this exercise as an institution in its own right, as the assumption in both Universities was that it was included in their own submissions due to its lack of separate legal and degree-awarding status. The Committee made a number of observations with regard to this assumption, **noting** that:

- i. it appeared most appropriate at the present time that HYMS was included as a constituent department in each Universities' separate submissions, but that the Committee was not clear as to the extent to which either York or Hull had incorporated HYMS data into their respective institutional submissions;
- ii. the Chief Operating Officer (COO) had discussed the TEF with his counterpart at Brighton and Sussex Medical School and as a joint initiative they were in a similar position to HYMS and not included as a separate institution in the TEF assessment;
- iii. the consultation on 'TEF Year 3' has been released by the Department of Education to pilot subject-level metrics and assessment, which would include the medicine and dentistry subject group. Further, that the role of HYMS in subject-level TEF assessments would be important for the Universities meaning it was important to ensure the contribution of HYMS data was clear to both Hull and York;
- iv. any future link between fee increases and the TEF that mean Hull and York set different tuition fees could be problematic for HYMS and would need careful discussion and planning.

The Chair and Deputy Chair agreed to keep each other informed as to their respective Universities' decisions of whether or not to participate in the subject-level TEF pilots.

**Action: Chair and Deputy Chair**

#### **16-17/57 TO CONSIDER MATTERS RAISED BY STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES**

The President of the GSA informed the Committee that the GSA had held its elections with a record turnout and that the new president who would attend future GSA meetings will be Charlotte Chamberlain. The VP Wellbeing and Community will be Fatma Layas.

There were no other contributions from the student representatives.

## 16-17/58 TO RECEIVE A WRITTEN REPORT FROM THE DEAN

a) The Dean introduced her report (enclosure 4), commenting that her first six months in post had been busy and that with a number of key short-term priorities the level of activity would continue apace. The Dean drew the Committee's attention to:

- i. Recent teaching appointments, principally to Hull linked to reorganisation of research centres and due to a review of Biomedical appointments at York which with its conclusion will enable further posts to be recruited there;
- ii. Role changes, appointments and vacancies in professional services staff;
- iii. The ongoing branding review though this is not yet at a stage where the Committee could review new marketing materials, to be centred on the new branding hook: 'a different kind of medical school';
- iv. The move to the Allam Building which has begun with staff in new offices as final work to complete the building is undertaken for the new academic year when students would begin using the space, which had been designed from the perspective of the student user;
- v. Ongoing activities to resolve long-standing issues with the video links for teaching between Hull and York and to work over the next 12-18 months to modernise assessment systems;
- vi. The initial positive outcome of the change to campus allocation policy for MBBS applicants, with a balanced distribution of confirmed offers at York and Hull, in part as the small number of international students preferred York;
- vii. Recruitment for the new admissions cycle which has begun well with very successful open days at York and Hull;
- viii. The School's review of its widening participation strategy to explore how a small team can make maximum impact in this area of HYMS' work;
- ix. Programme delivery which was going smoothly and particularly to the postgraduate Clinical Anatomy and Health Professions Education programmes where some changes will be proposed;
- x. Preparations for the Government's confirmed bidding process for medical training place expansion which are underway and that it is hoped that the announcement from government will be made soon following delays as a result of the general election. HYMS already has an extra 15 home places confirmed for 2018/19 and is exploring ways to maximise on the lifting of the cap on international student numbers.

b) During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. With regard to the teaching video links little additional testing has recently taken place and that the COO will ask both Universities' AV teams to view resolution of the issues as a priority due to the critical impact on teaching. Further, that if appropriate action was not forthcoming that the Chair and Deputy Chair would assist to help ensure the School's case is understood and a lasting solution implemented.
- ii. One of the key changes to professional services staff was the resignation of the Student Recruitment and Admissions Coordinator at a critical time for admissions, but that firm contingencies were in place, supported by Student Recruitment and Admissions at York.
- iii. With regard to the removal of the cap on international numbers there was a need for strategic decisions on fees setting to ensure HYMS sets an appropriately attractive international student fee. This observation led to some discussion about the process for

confirming fees for HYMS programmes and it was confirmed that the processes are in place to ensure suitable high-level sign-off, but that specific to the MBBS the Planning Officers were also liaising closely to organise a joint meeting to agree international fees.

- iv. New research directors would be appointed to work at each University and that recent research income obtained was considerable.
- v. The impact of change to the campus allocation policy would be carefully monitored and evaluated at the completion of the current cycle and early into the 2017/18 cycle. The Dean offered to report to HJSC on the evaluation of a review of the policy at its next meeting.

**Action: Dean**

- vi. The core branding message has the potential to appear reactive not proactive, but that there would be additional key messages to encourage a positive take on how and why HYMS is 'a different kind of medical school'.
- vii. Expansion plans would involve a wide-range of stakeholders and opportunities for the Universities to engage jointly with NHS partners. The Dean **reported** that she had met with all the partner NHS Trust Chief Executives, one of York's MPs with a meeting with the other MP arranged, met both University Chancellors and that she would also be meeting with the new Hull VC as well as York's VC about supporting a strong message on the value of HYMS expansion. Further it was **noted** that it was not clear where the Steering Group making preparations for expansion formally reported to, though the Dean explained that the Joint Board in October would focus discussions on expansion plans and that the Planning Officers and Deputy Vice-chancellors were fully involved.
- viii. It would be useful to update the Academic Quality Officers on the potential modifications proposed for the MSc Clinical Anatomy and the MSc in Health Professions Education to ensure that these programme changes could be appropriately considered and approved.

**Action: Chair BoS**

#### **16-17/59      TO DISCUSS A PAPER UPDATING THE COMMITTEE ON THE DEVELOPING RELATIONSHIP WITH THE UNIVERSITY OF KURDISTAN HEWLER**

The Dean introduced a paper providing the Committee with an update on the developing relationship with the University of Kurdistan Hewler (UKH) Medical School (enclosure 5).

a) The Dean **reported** that four students from UKH had begun the Diploma in Higher Education (Medical Sciences) in 2016 and that one had progressed, two were awaiting the outcome of resit assessments and one had withdrawn. There had been 18 applicants for places starting in 2017 and six offers had been made, with the students awaiting the outcome of their visa applications.

b) It was **noted** that progress to develop the partnership had been slower than anticipated, but that the School was mindful to take a cautious approach to ensure all factors were considered and risks mitigated. The speed of development was also related to the need for UKH to appoint faculty and professional staff members that would support the initiative. The Deans of both Schools have recently discussed the relationship and ways to continue to work towards HYMS supporting UKH

faculty and curriculum development. Work has also been undertaken supported by York's International Office to develop a partnership agreement which would be entered into at such time as the circumstances are right to consolidate initial activities.

c) The Committee **discussed** the School's desire to provide progression opportunities for the Diploma in HE students to Bachelor's level by initially enabling students to stay on for a third year to complete a BSc in Medical Science utilising the existing intercalated degrees. In due course it is hoped that some form of collaborative delivery can be approved whereby students would complete the Diploma in HYMS and the third year in UKH to obtain a BSc in Medical Science. This would require careful consideration of the type of collaborative relationship to enter and this was not yet clear. It was **reported** that the Quality Officer at York had already offered an initial view on the approval for a 'top-up' year and suggested that this should be proposed early in the new academic year to allow time for students wishing to progress to apply.

d) Part of the developing relationship is intended to be an MSc in Clinical Research Methods. This programme is in the early stages of development at York and agreement is needed as to whether this will be within HYMS or the Department of Health Sciences at York, what its delivery model will be and whether it will be part of the new collaborative relationship with an external commercial partner for distance learning provision at York.

e) The School proposed that before the relationship with UKH can be deepened it would be prudent to take a further intake of the Diploma in HE students and to review that initiative and the consolidation of the UKH faculty to assess the merits of a more comprehensive partnership. Further, it was **noted** that the Associate Dean for International was leading a working group to monitor and progress the relationship, and that decisions would also need taking to agree a process for the consideration and approval of collaborative provision involving HYMS. The Chair and Deputy Chair would discuss this as part of their handover with the intention of asking the Joint Board to discuss the matter.

**Action: Chair and Deputy Chair**

#### **16-17/60 TO APPROVE THE REVISED REGULATIONS FOR MASTER OF SCIENCE (MSc) BY THESIS**

The Committee **considered** revised *Regulations for Master of Science (MSc) by Thesis* degrees (enclosure 6). The Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board introduced the proposal, explaining that the regulations governing the award of MSc by Thesis have not been reviewed in detail since 2014 and that since that time, there have been a number of sector-wide changes to how higher degrees are managed. Notably, there is an acceptance that formal review of progress is required and on this basis, the regulations have been extensively reworked. Further, that the proposed regulations have been aligned closely to those of the University of Hull, although with careful consideration of regulations at York. The rationale being that the majority of MSc by Thesis students are Hull-based.

The Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board outlined the following substantial changes:

- The introduction of reference to formal progression points during the one year programme which had been left deliberately open pending confirmation of the process for assessing

progression (to be included in the Code of Practice on Research Degrees to be considered by HJSC at its next meeting);

- The inclusion of the need to demonstrate completion of satisfactory and appropriate training in Research Integrity;
- Inclusion of a section enabling HYMS to reserve the right to initiate a Leave of Absence in cases of risk;
- Inclusion of a section on Academic and Professional Discipline;
- Inclusion of a section enabling HYMS to reserve the right to rescind revoke or deprive award of academic qualifications.

During its discussion of the proposal the Committee **noted** that:

- A number of minor suggested amendments to correct typographical errors and to clarify ambiguous points had been identified which the Secretary could forward to the Chair of the PG Programmes Board for incorporation into the final draft;
- The right to revoke awards rested with the HJSC on the recommendation of the Board of Studies and this should be clear in the regulations;
- Appropriate reference should be made to University Fitness to Study policies which both universities have in place;
- Section 2.3 should be amended to clarify that 300 hours of 'teaching-related activity' should be referred to and that consideration should be given to the number of hours of such activity it was appropriate to consider for both full- and part-time study;
- The right of students to appeal the termination of their studies in accordance with the *Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals* should be included in appropriate sections, for example section 14;
- That section 7 on Leave of Absence should include reference to international students being directed to the appropriate advisors within the Universities on immigration and visa rules when considering applying for Leave of Absence;
- That the Regulations make suitable reference to the role the GSA, YUSU and HUU can play in supporting postgraduate research students.

The Committee noted the considerable work undertaken in preparing the revision to the Regulations and **approved** them subject to incorporation of the suggested revisions and final sign off by the Chair of HJSC.

**Action: Chair BoS**

#### **16-17/61 TO APPROVE THE REVISED REGULATIONS FOR MPhil AND PHD BY THESIS**

The Committee **considered** revised *Regulations for MPhil and PhD by Thesis* degrees (enclosure 7). The Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board introduced the proposal, explaining that the Regulations have not been reviewed in detail since 2014. Since that time, there have been a number of sector-wide changes in how higher degrees are managed. Notably, there is an acceptance that formal review of progress is required for higher degrees. Furthermore, the existing PhD regulations lack provision for 4-year PhD routes which are becoming available through a number of external funders. Therefore, the regulations have undergone extensive reworking, aligned closely to the

regulations of the University of Hull, where most research students are based, although with careful consideration of York's regulations.

The Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board outlined the following particularly substantial changes:

- Opportunity for four year PhD programmes which requires the creation of new route codes, as these are separate programmes with substantive differences to standard PhDs and would grant the student the title *PhD in Medical Sciences/Human Sciences (4 year route)*. The route codes needed would be for:

*PhD Medical Sciences (4 year route) – York*

*PhD Human Sciences (4 year route) – York*

*PhD Medical Sciences (4 year route) – Hull*

*PhD Human Sciences (4 year route) – Hull*

- Changes to the Thesis Advisory Panel process to include a formal review of progress at the anniversaries of registration, with the option to transfer students to different programmes or to terminate studies on the basis of unsatisfactory progress.
- Inclusion of the need to demonstrate completion of satisfactory and appropriate Research Integrity training.
- Inclusion of a section enabling HYMS to initiate a Leave of Absence in cases of risk.
- Inclusion of a section on Academic and Professional Discipline.
- Inclusion of a section enabling HYMS to reserve the right to rescind revoke or deprive award of academic qualifications.

During its discussion of the proposal the Committee **noted** that:

- The detail of the implementation of a number of points (for example, TAPs) would be included in the Code of Practice to be tabled at the next HJSC meeting;
- A number of minor suggested amendments to correct typographical errors and to clarify ambiguous points had been identified which the Secretary could forward to the Chair of the PG Programmes Board for incorporation into the final draft;
- The right to revoke awards rested with the HJSC on the recommendation of the Board of Studies and this should be clear in the regulations;
- Appropriate reference should be made to University Fitness to Study policies which both universities have in place;
- Section 2.4 should be amended to clarify that 300 hours of 'teaching-related activity' should be referred to and that consideration should be given to the number of hours of teaching-related activity it was appropriate to consider for both full- and part-time study;
- The right of students to appeal the termination of their studies in accordance with the *Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals* should be included in appropriate sections, for example section 20;
- That section 9 on Leave of Absence should include reference to international students being directed to the appropriate advisors within the Universities on immigration and visa rules when considering applying for Leave of Absence;
- That the Regulations make suitable reference to the role the GSA, YUSU and HUU can play in supporting postgraduate research students;

- That the word limit for the thesis had been changed after the Board of Studies approved the Regulations and that this now needed clarifying, with an additional check that it is clear in the agreed version what is included and excluded from the word limit;
- The Committee was being asked to approve new programmes outside the usual process for such actions which it **agreed** to do on the basis that the Regulations would be followed by programme documentation that detailed the four year PhDs to demonstrate their substantive difference from the existing PhDs, and that;
- The York Planning Officer had advised that the School should submit to Planning Committee a form for Planning Committee to note that the four year programmes are being introduced;

**Action: Chair BoS**

- Efforts had been made at York to make clear in regulations and other communications to students that referral on examination where corrections were requested did not amount to, and should not be referred to as, failure in the examinations and that it would be helpful if HYMS could replicate this action.

The Committee **noted** the considerable work undertaken in preparing the revision to the Regulations and **approved** them subject to incorporation of the suggested revisions and final sign off by the Chair of HJSC.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**16-17/62 TO APPROVE THE PROPOSED HYMS POLICY ON MEDICAL STUDENTS AS RESEARCH SUBJECTS AND MEDICAL STUDENTS UNDERTAKING RESEARCH AS A REPLACEMENT FOR THE HYMS POLICY ON STUDENT PARTICIPATION IN RESEARCH**

The Committee **considered** a new *Policy on Medical Students as Research Subjects and Medical Students Undertaking Research* (enclosure 8) to replace the current *Policy on Student Participation in Research* which now required updating to ensure it met the current needs to safeguard students.

The Policy would cover requests by others to use medical students as research students and medical students wishing to undertake research. It would clarify for the latter when HYMS has a duty of care for students involved in research during their period of registration and when during vacation periods they would be covered by an employer or other body.

During the discussion it was **noted** that the policy might be better composed to cover all students in HYMS that might be asked to participate in research, which would also require a change of title. The Chair BoS informed the Committee that the role of students as researchers was explicitly intended to cover Medical (MBBS) students as their programme does not have a research element through which other programmes cover the issues arising when undertaking research.

The Committee **approved** the policy subject to consideration of its feedback and revision by the Board of Studies. The revised policy to be signed-off by HJSC Chair's Action.

**Action: Chair BoS**

**16-17/63 TO APPROVE THE REVISED POLICY ON HONORARY TITLES AND ACCOMPANYING PRO FORMA RECOMMENDATION FROM THE DEAN OF HYMS FOR THE CONFIRMATION OF HONORARY PROFESSOR**

The Committee **considered** a revised *Policy on Honorary Titles* and accompanying pro forma for applications for Honorary Professorships (enclosure 9). The Dean introduced the proposal explaining that there was a need to simplify and clarify both the hierarchies for honorary appointments and the application process. This was within a wider national context of medical schools' concerns that current procedures can be cumbersome, particularly when Schools rely on a large number of honorary appointments to support teaching. It was **noted** that HYMS had undertaken a scoping exercise of practice at other medical schools as part of the preparatory work.

The Committee **noted** that:

- the new policy would only cover honorary titles and not also visiting titles;
- it would retain the division of approval decisions by the Dean for sub-professorial appointments and the Chair HJSC for honorary professorships;
- an annual review of honorary role-holders would now take place;
- the titles to be used for honorary titles replicated sector practice and would not be regarded as comparable in status to full academic posts.

The Committee **approved** the proposal and in doing so suggested that the Dean clarifies how visiting titles would be considered, as these were included in the previous policy though they are not part of the HJSC terms of reference.

**Action: Dean**

**16-17/64 TO APPROVE THE REVISED CRITERIA FOR DEGREE OF MBBS WITH HONOURS FROM 2017-18 (SCHEME D), FOLLOWING REVISIONS APPROVED 5 MAY 2017 TO THE CODE OF PRACTICE ON ASSESSMENT AND EXAMINATION FOR MBBS**

The Committee **considered** and **approved** a revision to the *Criteria for the Degree of MBBS with Honours from 2017-18* by the addition of a Scheme D (enclosure 10) which was required on account of changes made to the *Code of Practice on Assessment and Examination* approved at the previous HJSC meeting and to include within the calculation for honours new forms of assessment.

**16-17/65 TO RECEIVE A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE ON THE MBBS ACTION PLAN**

The Committee **received** a comprehensive MBBS action plan updated to May 2017 when the plan was presented to the Board of Studies, to review progress made since the previous Annual Programme Review and NSS results. The Committee **noted** the progress made and observed that the imminent release of NSS 2017 results meant the new action planning cycle would shortly begin.

**16-17/66 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A VERBAL UPDATE ON THE PREPARATION OF NEW MARKETING MATERIALS AND CORPORATE IMAGE**

This item was discussed as part of the Dean's Report (M16-17/58).

**16-17/67 VALEDICTIONS FOR RETIRING COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

The Chair thanked all members of the Committee for their contributions to HJSC during the last year and in particular those retiring academic and student members, and the Secretary for his support. The Chair reminded the Committee this would be his last as Chair with the Deputy Chair assuming the role from the 1<sup>st</sup> August 2017. A handover would be organised during the summer.

**16-17/68 DATES OF MEETINGS IN 2017-18**

Dates of meetings for 2017-18

- Thursday 26th October 2017 2pm-4pm
- Wednesday 24th January 2018 10am-12pm
- Wednesday 18th April 2018 2pm-4pm
- Wednesday 25th July 10am-12pm

**ANNEX A: Attendance**

**Members**

Professor Alan Speight (Chair, PVC Hull)

Professor John Robinson (Deputy Chair, PVC York) – left during the item M16-17/44

Professor Una Macleod (Dean, HYMS)

Dr Sam Cobb (Chair Board of Studies, HYMS)

Dr Jacquie White (Hull Senate representative)

Professor Martin Chalkley (York Senate representative)

Dr Rasha Ibrahim (Graduate Students' Association)\*

Professor Gillian Greenway (Hull Senate representative)

Professor Graham Scott (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)

Dr Penny Spikins (York Senate representative)

Dr Roger Sturmeay (Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board, HYMS)

Mr Salman Anwar (Education Officer, HUU)

**In attendance:**

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)

Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)

Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)

Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)

Professor Julie Jomeen (Dean of Faculty of Health Sciences, Hull)

Ms Lynne Braham (Deputy Director Academic Partnerships, Hull) – up to the conclusion of M16-15/59

**Apologies**

Mr Alex Urquhart (President, YUSU)

Mr Julian Porch (Academic Officer, YUSU)

Ms Lisa Tees (Quality Team, Hull)

Professor Brian Fulton (Dean of Faculty – Sciences, York)

Dr Jan Hardman (York University Teaching Committee representative)

Dr Claire Hookham-Williams (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)

Mr Vassili Crispi (Faculty Representative, Hull University Union)\*

Members marked with a \* do not attend for reserved business.