

**UNIVERSITY OF HULL
UNIVERSITY OF YORK**

HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL

JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 4th May 2017

PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS

16-17/37 APOLOGIES AND ATTENDANCE

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A

- a) The Chair welcomed members to the Committee and received apologies for absence.
- b) The Chair **noted** that this has been a transitional year for Hull University Union with the first election for some years of a Faculty Representative, at a time when the reorganisation of Hull's faculties will likely impact on this role, and with the departure of the HUU President mid-term creating additional responsibilities for the VP Education. As a consequence it was suggested that student membership be reviewed for the new academic session.

Action: Secretary HJSC

- c) The Chair **noted** the improved attendance at recent meetings and the hope that the limited attendance at this meeting was a one-off.

16-17/38 MINUTES 25th JANUARY 2017

The minutes of the meeting held on 25th January 2017 (enclosure 1) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting. The Chair also registered his apologies for being unavailable for the meeting due to other urgent business.

16-17/39 MATTERS ARISING

The Committee **received** a brief verbal update on M16-17/28 on the Chair BoS from the previous meeting regarding amendment to the MBBS Action Plan as this was also a separate agenda item (M16-17/46 refers).

16-17/40 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A LIST OF CHAIR'S ACTIONS SINCE THE PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee **received** a list of approvals by Chair's Actions (enclosure 2) since the last meeting. It was **noted** that with regard to M16-17/25.b.iv the Chair requested that the Joint Board review section 3.6 of the *Agreement between The University of Hull and The University of York in respect of The Hull York Medical School* to better reflect the role of HJSC in terms of HYMS' research activity. The

Joint Chairs of the Joint Board considered and approved the request and the section will be reworded to: “HJSC to receive information on relevant research activity through the Dean’s Report, and monitor any matters pertaining to research degrees”. The Memorandum of Agreement will now be updated by the University of Hull Solicitor to reflect this amendment.

In reporting the decision of the Joint Board the Chair questioned the extent to which the Universities would actively oversee the full range of HYMS research activities. It was **decided** that the current processes for considering and monitoring strategic issues relevant to each University work well and it is often appropriate for bilateral communications rather than collective ones to recognise each University’s research priorities.

It was **decided** that the Dean would include comment on high-level oversight of research in her report to the June 2017 Joint Board with a request it reflects upon the most appropriate processes to ensure comprehensive research oversight.

Action: Dean of HYMS

16-17/41 TO CONSIDER MATTERS RAISED BY STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

The student representatives had no issues to raise with the Committee.

16-17/42 TO RECEIVE A WRITTEN REPORT FROM THE DEAN

a) The Dean introduced her report (enclosure 3), highlighting that:

- i. There had been a number of recent teaching appointments including Professor Veysey as MBBS Programme Director and Professor Watt as Associate Dean (International), with a number of other posts having been, or shortly to be, advertised;
- ii. The Joint Board continues to review HYMS management and governance processes and that new HR processes are working well, with work in Planning, Finance and Registry remits to be undertaken;
- iii. Organisational changes in Hull resulting from the implementation of the new faculty structures have created some additional complexities for HYMS but that advantages of the creation of the new Faculty of Health Sciences of which HYMS is one School have also been identified;
- iv. HYMS is in the process of a branding review and that the plans for new branding will be brought for information to the next HJSC meeting;
- v. The initial outcome of the change to campus allocation policy for MBBS applicants was positive, with an asymmetric distribution of offers for places at Hull, but the expectation that the School will be on target for equally distributed registrations in the new academic year;
- vi. Postgraduate Taught programmes are progressing well and recruitment for the new year is encouraging on the whole;
- vii. A priority as Dean has been to meet with and develop the relationships with senior managers in the NHS Trust partners to discuss mutual needs and to support expansion plans within the School as part of the wider government context of growth in medical education;

- viii. As part of the ongoing implementation of the revised and delayed MBBS curriculum the planned changes to year 3 would be implemented in 2017 and those to year 4 in 2018, albeit with some appropriate adjustments to year 4 starting in 2017;
- ix. The School is reviewing the appointment of honorary and visiting roles process and that a proposal would be brought to the next HJSC meeting;
- x. The recent visit to the University of Kurdistan Hewler by the Associate Dean (International) and Head of Quality and Standards to discuss potential opportunities for collaborative partnership.

b) During the discussion it was **noted** that:

- i. The reorganisation of Hull's faculties has concluded with the creation of the Faculty of Health Sciences of which HYMS is a part. Within this model it is intended the 'strong schools' approach will be retained and respected, particularly in HYMS' case to recognise its existing strengths and unique position as a joint venture. It was also noted that with the exception of the COO no members of HYMS academic or senior professional services staff have taken roles within the new faculty structure though opportunities were available. As the new structures bed down structures and lines of communication will be established to ensure HYMS' input is facilitated and that any additional workload for some staff during the transitional phase eases.
- ii. The campus allocation policy had been implemented for the 2017 entry cycle as a pilot and on the a priori assumption that York would prove more attractive to applicants than Hull justifying a need to make more offers at Hull with the intention of a final equal distribution of places at registration. The Committee noted the Deputy Chair's concern with this assumption, proposing that in the absence of historical data the appropriate approach would be to assume an equal conversion rate and thus a need to offer an equal number of places at each university. The Dean reassured the Committee that the limited data on international student recruitment shows a preference for York, that this year is a pilot, the policy was being closely monitored and will reviewed, and that the expectation is that conversion rates should be equal with contingencies being prepared to address any need for students to swap university of registration to balance the allocation.
- iii. The position of postgraduate taught programmes was broadly healthy and that the new Clinical Anatomy and Physicians Associate Studies programmes had proven particularly attractive to applicants with an encouraging start also to deliver this academic year. Additionally it was noted that though the relative position of Human Anatomy and Evolution did not appear so positive, this programme expects to attract smaller numbers, often students that progress to PhD, and that through the partnership with York's Department of Archaeology modules often have very healthy student numbers.
- iv. The protracted implementation of the revised MBBS curriculum had been a result of staffing changes and a need to take additional time to fully prepare new teaching block structures, teaching materials and assessments. The changes now require a proposal to modify the programme which would need HJSC approval, though not to the extent that changes require GMC approval. It was also confirmed that students are aware of the majority of the plans and content with them, but that a concerted effort would be made to ensure that the details of those changes not yet shared with the year groups to be affected would be clearly communicated in due course, ahead of the respective cohort start dates for 2017/18.

- v. There is no process at present for the consideration and approval of collaborative partnerships HYMS wishes to develop with external partners and in the context of its own lack of institutional legal autonomy. The Committee **discussed** briefly the potential benefits and limitations of a joint process for consideration of collaboration or of utilising the processes of one of the universities with the agreement of the other to respect any decisions made. It was **decided** that a pragmatic approach would be to consider potential collaborations on a case by case basis and to assess based on the context of the proposal which university's procedures to follow, in close consultation with the other. Furthermore, it was suggested that the Chair asks the Joint Board to consider and advise on this issue to ensure that top-level university governance requirements would be met by any particular individually or jointly considered collaboration. Also, the expertise of the respective International Offices and Partnerships Offices of the Universities should be utilised and be advised to liaise closely with HYMS and their counterparts in the other institution.

Action: Chair

Finally it was noted that the recent visit to the University of Kurdistan had been positive, though it was too early to suggest what initiatives might result, other than the continuation of the admissions agreement for the Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences).

16-17/43 TO DISCUSS HYMS' PROPOSED RESPONSE TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH'S CONSULTATION ON EXPANDING NATIONALLY THE NUMBER OF MEDICAL DEGREE PLACES

The Dean introduced the School's proposed response (enclosure 4) to the Department of Health (DoH) consultation *Expansion of Undergraduate Medical Education: A consultation on how to maximise the benefits from the increases in medical student numbers* (March 2017) and invited the Committee to inform the final version of the response ahead of its submission to the DoH. It was **noted** that the response had been prepared following considerable internal consultation and that it would also be reviewed by the Vice-Chancellors before being submitted.

The Committee **noted** that the response was very balanced and thoughtful, and HJSC provided the school with suggestions to craft some answers to both address DoH questions directly and to maximise the potential to further the School's interests. For example, with regard to consideration in any bidding process for additional MBBS places of geographical location in relation to under-doctored areas, expertise in training in under-recruited specialties such as general practice and in widening participation.

16-17/44 TO APPROVE THE REVISED CODE OF PRACTICE ON ASSESSMENT AND EXAMINATION FOR MBBS

a) The Committee **considered** a proposal from the Board of Studies of a revised *Code of Practice on Assessment and Examination for MBBS* (enclosure 5) to address a need to articulate grade descriptors for progression and award decisions based on positive achievement of learning outcomes and a need

to address a perceived disproportionate weighting of Scholarship and Special Interest Programme (SSIP) assessment components in the calculation of progression. The School requested HJSC approval to introduce the changes in assessment for all new and existing MBBS (including Diploma of Higher Education (Medical Sciences) students from the respective cohorts' start dates for the 2017/18 academic year.

b) The Committee **noted** the proposal to remove the grade of 'borderline' fail in Phase I (years one and two) and to require students to obtain at least a 'pass' in all summative assessments to progress or to be entitled to lower exit or intended awards. This would be with the exception of the *component parts* of the SSIP which would retain 'borderline fail' as a means to compensate for poor achievement which could be addressed through feedback and supportive interventions. The Committee was informed that the 'borderline fail' grade has had the effect of masking pastoral and study skills weaknesses allowing students to progress that then struggle in later stages of the programme. It was argued that removing the grade would avoid such instances occurring, enabling support mechanisms to be implemented at an earlier stage. The proposal to remove 'borderline fail' has been discussed with students and they were supportive.

c) The progression rules would also consider the SSIP as one assessment unit *for progression or award* decisions that would be passed or failed, rather than considering the individual components as three separate contributing assessment units. The change would retain the integrity of the assessment process and provide a supportive mechanism for students with study skill development needs. The Chair of the Student Staff Committee **reported** that students supported the retention of 'borderline fail' in the SSIP as it provided a safety net to students when undertaking these assessment tasks which were quite different in format to the majority of those to which they are exposed.

d) The Committee **approved** the proposal subject to the follow revisions being made:

- Correction of the cross-reference in section 13.1 of the Code of Practice;
- Revision of the accompanying SSIP Handbook (enclosure 5c) 'borderline fail' descriptor to read: "*Partly achieved most learning outcomes but showed...*"

e) In approving the proposal, the Committee **noted** the observations made by the Chief Operating Officer (COO) that the academic change in assessment policy had considerable practical implications for implementation as the current IT systems used for managing assessment data is outdated, bespoke and inflexible. The COO requested the assistance of the Universities to support an urgent review and risk assessment of the changes. The Committee gave its support to the Chair BoS and COO to follow up this issue with the appropriate University services.

Action: Chair BoS assisted by COO

f) In **noting** HYMS' wish to implement the changes for all year groups from the start of the 2017/18 academic year, the Committee was reassured that a clear plan to communicate the changes to students was being prepared by the Board of Examiners and Assessment Team. Additionally, the Quality Officers of both Universities advised that though it would be usual to implement assessment changes for incoming students only, due to the complexities of the MBBS programme there was a case for implementing the change for existing students in their next academic year and onwards.

16-17/45 TO RECEIVE THE ANNUAL REPORT ON WIDENING PARTICIPATION AND ADMISSION

The Committee **received** the Annual Report on Widening Participation and Admission for the MBBS programme (enclosure 6). It was **noted** that HYMS' widening participation activity feeds into the Universities' reports also as part of the obligations for reporting to the Office for Fair Access, and that the School maintains well-established relationships with the Universities' WP teams.

16-17/46 TO RECEIVE AN UPDATE ON THE MBBS ACTION PLAN

The Committee **received** a summary update on the implementation of the MBBS Action Plan (enclosure 7). It **noted** that the action on the Chair BoS from the last meeting (M16-17/28 refers) had yet to be completed and requested that a full updated copy of the Action Plan be submitted to the next HJSC meeting to monitor progress.

Action: Chair BoS

16-17/47 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION THE MEDICAL SCHOOLS ANNUAL REPORT (MSAR) SUBMITTED TO THE GMC

The Head of Quality and Standards **reported** that the GMC has stated that feedback would be available on the MSAR in time for the next HJSC meeting.

16-17/48 DATES OF REMAINING MEETINGS 2016-17 AND MEETINGS 2017-18

- Wednesday 26th July 2017, 10.00am-12.00pm – 1st Floor meeting room HYMS York/ Loxley Hull

Dates of meetings for 2017-18

- Thursday 26th October 2017 2pm-4pm
- Wednesday 24th January 2018 10am-12pm
- Wednesday 18th April 2018 2pm-4pm
- Wednesday 25th July 10am-12pm

ANNEX A: Attendance

Members

Professor Alan Speight (Chair, PVC Hull)

Professor John Robinson (Deputy Chair, PVC York) – left during the item M16-17/44

Professor Una Macleod (Dean, HYMS)

Dr Sam Cobb (Chair Board of Studies, HYMS)

Dr Jacquie White (Hull Senate representative)

Professor Martin Chalkley (York Senate representative)
Ms Rasha Ibrahim (Graduate Students' Association)*
Ms Millie Beach (York University Students' Union)*
Mr Matt Thorneycroft (Hull University Union)* - joined during the item M16-17/42

In attendance:

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)
Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)
Professor Brian Fulton (Dean of Faculty – Sciences, York)
Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)
Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)
Ms Lisa Tees (Quality Team, Hull)
Ms Oladunni Adeleye (Acting Chair Staff Student Committee, HYMS)*
Observer – Professor Martin Veysey (MBBS Programme Director, HYMS)

Apologies

Dr Jan Hardman (York University Teaching Committee representative)
Professor Gillian Greenway (Hull Senate representative)
Professor Graham Scott (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)
Dr Claire Hookham-Williams (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)
Professor Richard Waites (York University Teaching Committee representative)
Dr Penny Spikins (York Senate representative)
Mr Vassili Crispi (Faculty Representative, Hull University Union)*

Members marked with a * do not attend for reserved business.