

**UNIVERSITY OF HULL
UNIVERSITY OF YORK**

HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL

JOINT SENATE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 4th November 2015

PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS

15-16/01 APOLOGIES AND ATTENDANCE

For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A

The Deputy Chair convened the meeting in the Chair's absence, welcomed members to the Committee and received apologies for absence.

15-16/02 MINUTES 30th APRIL 2015

The minutes of the meeting held on 30th April 2015 (enclosure 1) were reviewed and **approved** as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

15-16/03 MATTERS ARISING

The Committee **received** for information a summary of outstanding actions and matters arising from the previous meeting (enclosure 2). Items listed as separate agenda items and other completed actions were noted.

14-15/32 and 14-15/45d – re adoption of a Fitness to Study Policy. With the departure of the previous Chair Board of Studies further work is now planned on introducing a Fitness to Study Policy in HYMS and reviewing the interrelationship between similar policies.

15-16/04 TO RECEIVE FOR INFORMATION A LIST OF CHAIR'S ACTIONS SINCE THE PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee **received** a list of approvals by Chair's Actions since the last meeting and other actions undertaken by the Chair (enclosure 3 with addendum).

It was noted that with regard to the Hull student membership of the Committee the Chair has invited the HUU VP Education to meet to discuss the most appropriate role holder to represent the Hull student body, alongside the HUU President¹. The Committee agreed that it was important to

¹ Secretary's Note: This issue had been discussed previously (M14-15/04a refers) and a number of discussions had taken place during the summer vacation 2015 to propose a solution.

include the most appropriate student representatives as reflects the status of the Committee and to ensure representatives had sufficient knowledge of HYMS to make full contributions to the meeting.

It was suggested that the Chair or Deputy Chair of the Staff Student Liaison Committee in HYMS could be an appropriate second student representative. The Chair and HUU VP Education will discuss and propose a suitable representative in due course.

Action: Chair and VP Education

15-16/05 TO a) APPROVE THE MEMBERSHIP, ANNUAL CYCLE OF BUSINESS AND TO REVIEW THE TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE COMMITTEE AND b) CONSIDER AND APPROVE A CHANGE TO THE FREQUENCY OF MEETINGS AND METHOD OF CIRCULATION OF PAPERS

The Committee received enclosure 4 which consolidated a number of matters for information and approval regarding its organisation and work:

- a) The terms of reference as set by the Joint Board were noted for information.
- b) The Committee considered and **approved** its 2015-16 membership with the following notes and amendments: that the student representation would be confirmed as in M15-16/04; that Professor Bennett's role be corrected to Chair of the Postgraduate Programmes Board, and that the in attendance membership be amended to refer to a Quality Manager from the University of Hull rather than a named individual (following recent discussion between the Secretary and Ian Smallwood, Quality Manager, Hull).
- c) The annual cycle of business was considered and **approved**.
- d) The Committee considered and **approved** a request to add a fourth meeting to the calendar to be held during the summer after the June Board of Studies meeting. It was noted that this would enable business continuity between the summer term and autumn term meetings. The meeting will be organised with due consideration to Committee members' terms of office. The Secretary will liaise with HYMS to organise a suitable meeting date.

Action: Secretary

- e) The Committee considered and **approved** a proposal to circulate meeting papers electronically only in future, except on individual exceptional requests for hard copies. It was suggested that circulating the papers as a single PDF would be the most ideal. The Secretary will action this particular request as far as is practicable.

Action: Secretary

15-16/06 TO CONSIDER MATTERS RAISED BY STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

- a) The Hull representatives informed the Committee that they are in discussions with the Chair in his capacity as PVC Education at Hull to find an effective way in which HYMS students, via

the Faculty Coordinator role can be part of the HUU representative body. No further issues were brought to the Committee's attention.

- b) The YUSU representative informed the Committee that MBBS student Ed Miller was the HYMS department rep on the Union and it was noted that relationships are developing between the School's internal representative bodies and the unions. No further issues were brought to the Committee's attention.
- c) The GSA representative questioned whether there was any particular reason why his colleagues had made little comment in previous meetings as part of this item, for example HYMS students' limited engagement with the Association generally. Members noted that research students at York are largely embedded in departments so may not present to the GSA as HYMS students and that the characteristics of postgraduate taught students, who are mainly clinicians studying part-time, means they may also not consider the opportunities on offer from the GSA as relevant to them. The Committee was assured that postgraduate student representatives actively contribute to School committees and that their voice is heard and acted upon. The students' unions and GSA were asked to continue their activities to liaise with the HYMS student at undergraduate and postgraduate levels to further develop relationships.

15-16/07 TO RECEIVE A WRITTEN REPORT FROM THE DEAN

- a) The Dean introduced his report (enclosure 5), highlighting:
 - i) Revisions to the HYMS strategy, the completion of organisational changes and further proposals to enhance the organisation and leadership within the School.
 - ii) Agreement with both Universities' libraries leading to the transfer of responsibilities to them for HYMS library provision to enhance the service available.
 - iii) The School's stronger financial position that will enable it to recruit to frozen and new posts for the benefit of the learning and teaching experience, but the risks and difficulties for HYMS presently resulting from the difficult financial climate and organisational issues within the NHS that can affect the quality of learning and teaching.
 - iv) Strong National Student Survey results, admissions of home and overseas students in 2015-16 and encouraging applications for 2016-17 in a difficult climate for medical schools.
 - v) Higher Education Academy accreditation in June 2015 of the PG Cert in Health Professions Education. Also, ongoing discussions to develop a relationship with Central Park Medical College, Lahore, to deliver face-to-face elements of the PG Cert in Lahore should agreement be reached to enrol a cohort of students onto the programme in 2016.
 - vi) Infrastructure initiatives such as the introduction of the e-Record of Achievement and upgrades to video links between the Universities which will be carefully managed to provide the expected standard of service.
 - vii) The desire of the School to engage more frequently and effectively with the quality teams in the Universities to better enable HYMS to learn of good practice that might be adopted by HYMS

and so the quality teams can keep abreast of activities in the School. The Committee supported this suggestion. The Secretary will approach colleagues at Hull to arrange such a meeting between the quality teams and HYMS staff.

Action: Secretary

viii) The proposed introduction of a postgraduate programme to train Physician Associates, which are a relatively new NHS role. The programme involves a national curriculum and assessment and would be organised in conjunction with the Dept of Health Sciences (York) and Faculty of Health and Social Care (Hull). This programme will be presented to the Board of Studies in December 2015 and to the next HJSC for consideration. The Dean assured the Committee that the characteristics and rationale for the new programme would be clearly and carefully communicated to MBBS students as the experience in the sector generally had showed these students were anxious about the implications for their careers of this new role in the NHS.

The Deputy Chair thanked the Dean for his comprehensive report and congratulated the School on notable achievements, particularly: the NSS overall satisfaction and personal development results; the completion of organisational reviews, and; research activity in HYMS.

b) Members of the Committee raised the following points:

i) The Dean was asked if future reports could include appropriate references to activities promoting equality, diversity and inclusion. It was noted that the School takes seriously its commitment to equality and diversity, for example: in admissions, student progression and attainment and as an Athena SWAN bronze award holder.

Action: Dean

ii) That in relation to the HYMS Research Office Report (enclosure 5, appendix 3) the division of current and prospective research students between Hull, York and HYMS could be clearer and also the report could better express HYMS' contribution in research income to each university.

Action: Dean

15-16/08 TO RECEIVE A REPORT ON THE CONTINUED IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NEW MBBS CURRICULUM FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS TO THE PLANNED IMPLEMENTATION IN 2014/15

Janine Henderson, the MBBS Programme Director attended this item to update the Committee on the continued implementation of the new MBBS programme and to explain the outcomes of pausing elements of the proposed change identified as risks to the quality of learning and teaching (enclosure 6). It was stressed that only elements of critical concern had been paused and that roll out of the new curriculum was beginning to move to business as usual and ongoing development. The Deputy Chair asked that an update on continued progress made by the MBBS team be tabled at the next appropriate HJSC following MBBS Programme Board and Board of Studies.

Action: Chair BoS

15-16/09 TO CONSIDER AND APPROVE A NEW POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMME LEADING TO AN MSc IN CLINICAL ANATOMY OR AN MSc IN CLINICAL ANATOMY AND EDUCATION

Peter Bazira, the Programme Director attended to speak to this proposal (enclosures 7a-7p).

a) Dr Bazira explained that the rationale for the programme was to meet MBBS students' demand for a Masters level intercalated programme in anatomy, to provide training for those wishing to develop careers in clinical anatomy education and to provide a foundation of training for those wanting to pursue later specialist surgical training. This latter motivation was more aspirational and would need additional modules to be added later.

The Deputy Chair noted that the Secretary had identified a number of points in the enclosures that he would bring to Dr Bazira's attention outside the meeting for appropriate incorporation.

Action: Secretary

b) The Committee discussed the programme and raised the following points:

i) An external assessor had questioned the appropriateness of the programme title as reflected in the aims and content. The Committee questioned the degree to which the programme involved lab-based practical activities that would train students in dissection techniques to a sufficiently refined degree. Dr Bazira explained that the programme intends to provide students with practical skills as required to understand anatomical structures through dissection more than fine-tuning dissection skills per se. However, the programme has been revised following discussion with the external assessors to clarify the extent to which students will gain practical experience through a mixture of staff-led instruction and supervision and students following detailed step-by-step resource guides for directed independent lab-based learning.

ii) Concern was raised about the nature and extent of formative and summative assessment throughout the programme. Dr Bazira assured members that students would receive formative feedback on practical dissection as required to understand sufficiently the anatomical structures being studied. He will also check the module and programme specifications (specifically table B, page 29 of the programme specification) to ensure that the number of assessment opportunities for each module was appropriate and accurately recorded the overall assessment regime.

iii) The programme specification did not clearly explain how students on the two part-time routes would be supervised through the ISM to meet its various assessment points. It was felt this needed to be expressed better in the documentation as well as working in practice to ensure part-time students' maintain motivation and momentum when completing the ISM over an extended period. Dr Bazira agreed to review the ISM descriptor and programme specification.

iv) The timeline for academic programme approval was such that HJSC had been asked to approve the proposal on the same day as York's Planning Committee had approved it and with the planning process at Hull to be completed. It was noted that the two universities operate very different processes for approving a programme's business case, which added complexity for the School when introducing new provision. The Committee was content to consider the proposal on the expectation that Hull would shortly be satisfied with the business case.

The Committee **approved** the proposal subject to consideration and incorporation of the points discussed and those to be forwarded by the Secretary, with final sign-off to be by Chair's Action.

Action: Chair BoS

15-16/10 TO NOTE FOR INFORMATION THE TRANSFER OF THE MSc IN HUMAN ANATOMY AND EVOLUTION FROM HYMS TO THE DEPARTMENT OF ARCHAEOLOGY AT YORK FROM 2016.

The Committee noted that York Planning Office is leading on the arrangements to transfer the MSc in Human Anatomy and Evolution to the Department of Archaeology at York from the start of the 2016-17 academic year. Following completion of the Planning process University Teaching Committee will oversee the new governance arrangements to be managed by the Archaeology Board of Studies. The Chair gave his support for the transfer on 4th September 2015.

COMMITTEE APPROVAL OF CODES OF PRACTICE, POLICIES AND REGULATIONS

Secretary's note: HJSC previously requested an annual tracker of minor amendments to Codes and Policies that were made without requiring approval by the Committee or Chair (M13-14/36 refers). No changes have been made in this way for the Committee's review.

15-16/11 TO CONSIDER AND APPROVE A REVISED CODE OF PRACTICE ON ACADEMIC AND FITNESS TO PRACTISE APPEALS

The Head of Quality and Standards presented a revised Code of Practice on Academic and Fitness to Practise Appeals for consideration and **approval** (enclosure 8). Members were reminded of the extensive process of consultation and drafting that resulted in the 2014 version, but the Committee was informed that this required minor revisions following the OIA's publication of guidance on good practice for the management of complaints and appeals. The Committee reviewed a mapping exercise to understand how the proposed Code reflected the OIA guidance.

The Committee was assured that to supplement the Code, easily accessible online student-friendly guidance had been produced. It was reported that feedback from the student body had been positive so far with regard to this guidance.

The Committee discussed the intended meaning and clarity of section 16.2 and proposed its revision to include provision for a student to ask for a review of the Appeal Committee's decision in line with section 17 and not just to refer the student to the OIA if they were dissatisfied with the decision. However, the Committee advised care in revising the section so to avoid wording that could be interpreted as suggesting the Appeal Committee's decision was open to wider challenge than the specific provisions of section 17.

The Code was **approved** subject to the amendment advised which could be signed off by Chair's Action.

Action: Chair BoS

15-16/12 TO CONSIDER AND APPROVE A REVISED CODE OF PRACTICE ON INVESTIGATION AND DETERMINATION OF STUDENT COMPLAINTS

The Head of Quality and Standards presented a revised Code of Practice on Investigation and Determination of Student Complaints for consideration and **approval** (enclosure 9). She informed members that HYMS rarely receives complaints, but that this Code required substantial revision following the publication of the OIA's good practice guidance on complaints and appeals. The Committee reviewed a mapping exercise to understand how the Code reflected the OIA guidance.

The student representatives requested that links be added to the 'further guidance' section at the start of the Code to Students' Union services. The Hull representatives also drew the Committee's attention to the recent number of enquiries to their advice service from medical students which could be viewed as complaints but where the students did not want to take this route out of concern for how it would reflect back on them. The Dean assured the Committee that HYMS welcomed the opportunity to discuss students' complaints with them informally and through the formal procedure and that students or the Unions could contact him directly if there were concerns about raising issues with other role holders.

The Head of Quality and Standards had identified a need to make the complaints procedure more prominent and will examine where best to locate the information on the website to raise its profile. A named complaints email address has also been set up to further increase visibility of the complaints reporting processes.

The Committee discussed what opportunities might exist for proportionate logging of issues raised and resolved informally and formally to ensure HYMS is aware of all minor and major complaints and to monitor the appropriate resolution of issues brought to its attention. It was suggested that section 6.2 be revised to ensure it unambiguously refers to the informal resolution of complaints and not to complaints made in an informal manner.

The Committee noted that the OIA guidance has introduced the facility for groups of students to raise a complaint (or an appeal in relation to M15-16/11) collectively and that this provision had been incorporated into the proposed code. The School gave assurances it would take all reasonable action to ensure that in a group complaint all individuals have the opportunity to express their personal dissatisfaction with the outcome of the complaint, irrespective of the expectation that any group appoints a single member to represent it and communicate with the School.

The Code was **approved** subject to the minor revisions detailed and for sign off by Chair's Action.

Action: Chair BoS

15-16/13 TO CONSIDER AND APPROVE a) A REVISED CODE OF PRACTICE ON AWARD OF HONORARY AND VISITING TITLES AT HULL YORK MEDICAL SCHOOL AND b) A TEMPLATE FOR CHAIR'S ACTION APPROVAL OF NOMINATIONS FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF HONORARY AND VISITING PROFESSORS

a) The Committee considered a revised Code of Practice on Award of Honorary and Visiting Titles at Hull York Medical School (enclosure 10a). The Chief Operating Officer informed the Committee that the proposed changes are made as: a response to the difficulties for working clinicians to fit in additional appraisals of their educational activities and as NHS trust appraisals include educational activities; the establishment of realistic teaching workload expectations; to reflect the organisational changes at HYMS affecting the composition of the nomination approval panels.

It was suggested that section 7.2 be revised to make explicit that 'those who undertake research or scholarly activity' includes the expectation that research student supervisors not employed by HYMS or the Universities of Hull or York hold honorary titles.

It was further suggested that section 7.3 be revised to state 'the duties of *internal examiner*'.

The Code was **approved** subject to the suggested amendments to be signed off by Chair's Action.

Action: The Dean

b) The Committee considered and **approved** a template on which nominations for honorary and visiting professorships can be submitted to the Chair for his approval (enclosure 10b), in accordance with the Code of Practice on Award of Honorary and Visiting Titles at Hull York Medical School.

15-16/14 DATES OF MEETINGS 2015-16

The Committee was informed that due to the expected absence of the Chair from the next scheduled meeting (20th January 2016) it might be re-scheduled. The Secretary will ask the Chair's intentions and liaise with the School and Committee to confirm the date of the next meeting.

With regards to M15-16/05d, the Secretary will also confirm the date for the additional meeting. The current dates are:

- Wednesday 20 January, 2.00-4.00pm: 1st floor Loxley, Hull / **HG15, Heslington Hall**, York
- Wednesday 20 April, 10.00am-12.00pm: 1st floor Loxley, Hull / main meeting room York

Action: Secretary

ANNEX A: Attendance

Members

Professor John Robinson (Deputy Chair, PVC York)

Professor Gillian Greenway (Hull Senate representative)

Professor Trevor Sheldon (Dean of HYMS)

Dr Steven Oliver (Chair Board of Studies, HYMS)

Professor Jonathan Bennett (Chair of Postgraduate Programmes Board, HYMS)

Mr Chuby Okide (Hull University Union)*
Mr Matt Evans (Hull University Union)*
Mr Sean Pullen (York University Students' Union)*
Professor Martin Chalkley (York Senate representative)
Dr Jan Hardman (York University Teaching Committee representative) – left during item 12
Dr Richard Waites (York University Teaching Committee representative) – left after item 11
Mr John Busby (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)

In attendance:

Dr Adrian Lee (Secretary, York)
Mr Peter Gorbert (CEO Graduate Students' Association, York)*
Mrs Alison Pettigrew (Head of Quality and Standards, HYMS)
Mr Stuart Gilkes (Quality Officer, Hull)
Dr Peter Bazira (HYMS) – attended up to and including item 9
Dr Janine Henderson (HYMS) – attended item 8

Apologies

Professor Alan Speight (Chair, PVC Hull)
Professor Julie Jomeen (Hull Senate representative)
Dr Elizabeth Cleaver (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)
Dr Graham Scott (Hull Learning, Teaching and Assessment Committee representative)
Dr Penny Spikins (York Senate representative)
Ms Rasha Ibrahim (Graduate Students' Association, York)*
Ms Menglin Liu (Graduate Students' Association, York)*
Mr Thomas Ron (York University Students' Union)*
Mr Ben Leatham (York University Students' Union)*
Mr Nigel Dandy (Head of Academic Support Office, York)
Professor Brian Fulton (Dean of Faculty – Sciences, York)

Members marked with a * do not attend for reserved business.