Minutes of the meeting held on 8th November 2023

PART A: UNRESERVED BUSINESS – CATEGORY I

M23-24/01 Attendance, Apologies and Valedictions
For a list of attendees and apologies, please see Annex A.

The Chair welcomed the Committee. A request for any declarations of conflicts of interest was made and none were received. The Committee welcomed new members. See Terms of Reference 2023-24 (M23-24/04 refers).

M23-24/02 Minutes 29 June 2023
The minutes (HJSC.23-24.01) were reviewed and approved as a true and accurate record of the meeting, with minor typographical amendments which had been completed.

M23-24/03 Matters Arising
The Committee received a list of matters arising (HJSC.23-24.02). All matters were closed apart from the following actions from the last meeting:

- Offering the HYMS module Practical Skills in Virtual Anatomy and Morphology as an option to other students:
  This had been explored in the University of York School of Physics, Engineering and Technology. It was not yet possible to offer the option to University of Hull students owing to changes being undertaken in the MSc Biomedical Engineering programme, though it was planned to discuss in the future.

  **Action:** Claire Hughes to confirm with Peter Bazira whether the University of York School of PET wants to offer HYMS option module.

- HYMS Policy on Students Visiting Patients at Home:
  The HYMS Governance Manager and Deputy Dean had provided revised wording following HYMS Joint Senate Committee (HJSC) feedback (see Annex B). The Committee approved the revised wording.

  *Cytherea Shen joined the meeting.*

M23-24/04 Report of Chair’s Actions undertaken since the last Meeting
The Committee received a list of Chair’s Action approvals (HJSC.23-24.03) since the last meeting:

- As agreed at the 22-23 Away Day, 3 additional Student Representatives would be added to the Committee membership.

M23-24/05 Committee’s membership and terms of reference
The Committee considered and approved its membership, which had been updated to reflect new members.

**ACTION: Secretary to add terms of office for members in attendance.**

The Committee considered and approved an addition to its Terms of Reference (HJSC.23-24.04):

“To consider the workload associated with the Committee’s business, including via consideration of the impact of the Committee’s decisions on staff workload; and to oversee the workload associated with being a member of the Committee.”

This addition had been suggested to align with updates to the University of York Teaching Committee following recommendations from the University of York Workload Management Group. The Committee noted that consideration of workload implications was also being undertaken within HYMS.

**ACTION: Lisa Tees to explore updating the Terms of Reference of relevant University of Hull Committees to include reference to workload.**

**M23-24/06 To Receive an Oral Report from the Student Representatives**

All Student Representatives were looking forward to working with colleagues in HYMS and fostering collaboration between the Universities of Hull and York:

- The YUSU Academic Officer had undertaken work on the University of York policy on assessment.
- The HUSU President of Education had been working with the Student Voice and Opportunities team to launch an inaugural student societies fair within the Medical School, and with the Health Sciences Faculty Representative to implement a student passport so that reasonable adjustments information can be easily taken through to placements.
- The HYMS Hull Lead had been working on supporting students with the transition into University life.
- There were now separate positions for HYMS PGT Representative and PGR Representative, although they remained as yet unfilled.

The Committee noted that HYMS Student Representatives had instigated a tracker of issues that was shared with all HYMS academic boards, which could also be shared with HJSC. The tracker had been a very positive development particularly for the MB BS programme.

**ACTION: Lucy Ambrose to report on the HYMS Student Representatives tracker for the next Joint Senate.**

**M23-24/07 Report from the Dean of HYMS**

The Dean provided following updates:

i. **Student numbers**

   Overall undergraduate medicine student numbers had been met despite a challenging recruitment cycle. With the exception of the Physician Associate programme, postgraduate student numbers had decreased. The School was seeking to resolve this for the next cycle.

ii. **Expansion**

   An increase in medical student places was planned nationally. HYMS are in contact with the Office for Students about plans for 2025 onwards. The School has set up a project group
including work commissioned by external experts; an output is expected in Spring 2024.
There might be opportunities for new modes of delivery for medical schools, such as a
4-year programme as discussed by bodies such as the GMC, NHS England and the Medical
Schools Council. This would be a new and additional programme for HYMS, with the Board
of Studies and Joint Senate closely involved.
Apprenticeships would be a modest part of the planned expansion but not a majority. At a
national level the first cohort of students started an apprenticeship programme in 2024.
There are plans at national level to revise details around financial planning of
apprenticeships.

iii. School updates
The New Dean for the Faculty of Health Sciences would be Laura Treadgold, who would be
starting in January, bringing a significant history of medical school leadership and medical
education experience.
A number of new colleagues had started in HYMS (noted in Annex C).
Interviews were taking place for the new Dean post and an announcement would be made
soon.
The School had been celebrating its 20th Anniversary this year, celebrating with alumni
events, research successes, inaugural lectures and a staff event about global strategy.

The Committee noted with respect to apprenticeship programmes that these were offered at the University
of York and monitored by Ofsted. Upcoming new apprenticeship programmes included Nursing and Social
Work.

M23-24/08 Annual report by the Chair of the Board of Studies for 2022-23

The Committee discussed the report (HJSC.23-24.05). The Chair of the Board of Studies (BoS) highlighted
that BoS had been considering a new student withdrawal process that will sit across both the Universities of
Hull and York. The Chair of BoS thanked the Chairs of HJSC for their support regarding recent student
appeals.

The Committee discussed student surveys and the following points were made:
● Participation in the National Student Survey would be retained at both Universities.
● Response rates for the national Postgraduate Taught Experience Survey (PTES) and Postgraduate
  Research Experience Survey (PRES) were consistently low. This did not represent the student body
  and raised questions about the data validity. As a result, the University of York had decided not to
  proceed with PTES for 2023-24. The University of Hull Strategic Insight Team was undertaking a
  report into all student surveys including module evaluation. At the University of York, senior leaders
  would also be discussing module evaluation in the coming weeks.
● Response rates for internal HYMS twice-yearly programme surveys were higher with an average
  response rate of 50%.
● The International Student Barometer provided useful data over 3 years for the University of Hull to
gauge against a comparator set, but for all surveys the cost-benefit balance should be considered.
● University-wide internal surveys and monitoring such as the Annual Review provide useful data to
  inform School process and policies and plan for the future.

Helen Fenwick joined the meeting.
M23-24/09  CONFIDENTIAL: Results of the National Student Survey 2023

The Director of MBBS presented the report (HJSC.23-24.06). There had been a good overall response rate of 73%, with HYMS performing better on average than each respective University. In 2022, there had been a dip in the areas of Assessment & Feedback, Organisation and Management, and Student Voice. In 2023, scores had improved in Assessment and Feedback and Student Voice, but Academic Support and Organisation and Management remained low. HYMS was undertaking discovery work with the Student Union to understand this, including exploring students’ academic support needs in clinical placement years 3-5, as well as timetabling and placement management issues.

Last year’s Action Plan had contained numerous actions; this year’s aim was for fewer, more specific actions.

The Committee discussed the following points:

- The University of York Sciences Faculty Teaching Leader had been focusing on NSS and was working with Departments to improve communications with students; there was an opportunity to work with HYMS here. HYMS students may receive slightly differing NSS questions, depending on the University at which they are registered.

  **ACTION:** Claire Hughes and Julie Castronovo and colleagues to discuss working together on NSS communications strategy.

- Communication strategy with current students was a key priority for the University of Hull and this could be an area of collaboration with the University of York. Decisions at HJSC should be made in view of how those decisions are communicated to students.

M23-24/10  Updates to the Code of Practice on Assessment and Evaluation for MBBS

The Committee considered and **approved** the updates to the Code of Practice (HJSC.23-24.07a/i).

In discussion the following points were made:

- The phrase “satisfactory attendance” had been used as an interim measure. There was not currently a required set attendance percentage in view of variation at placements. The MB BS Board was considering a piece of work about professionalism and attendance this academic year and students would be consulted as part of this.

- The Code of Practice on Assessment and Evaluation made reference to the Code of Practice on Academic Misconduct, within which there was not yet any mention of Artificial Intelligence (AI). The School was working nationally on this with the Medical Schools’ Council regarding the Medical Licensing Assessment, and was analysing other assessments in view of the impact of AI. The School was keen to work with both the University of York and University of Hull in this area.

- There was a typographic error in the Definition of Terms which would be corrected.

- It would be clarified in the Definitions of Terms and throughout the policy that compensation is not permissible for the Gateway Year.

  **ACTION:** Lisa Tees to consult with Peter Bazira about correcting references to compensation in the Definition of Terms and section 13.
● It was clarified that item 15.4 outlined the process whereby if a student repeats a year and exceptional circumstances have been agreed, students will be able to have a first sit attempt at their assessment.

● The updated Code of Practice would be communicated to students including in Assessment Seminars.

M23-24/11  Policy on Credit-Rated and Non-Credit-Rated Continuing Professional Development (CPD)

The Committee considered and approved the new Policy (HJSC.23-24.07a/ii).

The Committee discussed the following:

● The Policy had resulted from productive conversations and sharing of best practice across both Universities. A CPD Framework would follow.

● New CPD courses would need to be developed in consultation with Marketing. The paper outlined that a business case approval runs alongside the academic approval and would be considered at HYMS Operational Group. An amendment was suggested that it be made clear that CPD proposals would be reviewed by staff with Marketing expertise.

● There would be a need to ensure that new CPD provision does not overlap with existing provision at both Universities. This would be considered as part of the academic approval stage in the CPD policy, but both Universities may also benefit from aligning CPD strategy at a broader level. The University of York was already developing a CPD strategy as part of the Sciences and Social Sciences Faculty Strategic Plan. As HYMS develop CPD proposals, colleagues are encouraged to communicate with the University of York Associate Deans for Teaching, Learning and Students who can share ideas with the Portfolio Management Board, and at the University of Hull with the Education Planning Committee.

  **ACTION:** Nadine Smith to incorporate CPD discussion into the HYMS Operational Group

  **ACTION:** Peter Bazira to incorporate CPD into HYMS academic plan and provide a costing spreadsheet to Helen Fenwick.

M23-24/12  Proposed changes to the standard setting method in Clinical Science and Practice modules’ written examinations in the Physician Associate programme

The Committee considered and approved the proposed changes (HJSC.23-24.07a/iii).

The new standard setting method was already used effectively in the MB BS programme as well as used internationally. The HYMS academic leadership team would work with tutors to ensure that there would be sufficient faculty to deliver the teaching and standard setting.

The new method of standard setting would be introduced alongside a sense check using the old method, which would enable a comparison to assess the effectiveness of the new method.

M23-24/13  Policy on Honorary Titles
The Committee considered and approved the Policy ((HJSC.23-24.07a/iv)

In discussion the following points were made:

- It was clarified that the policy was an updated version that had been through an Equality Impact Assessment. All new policies from the HYMS Board of Studies would contain this. The Committee reflected on the importance of the new approach using Equality Impact Assessments.

**ACTION: Lisa Tees to liaise with the University of Hull Governance Manager regarding the University’s use of Equality Impact Assessments**

- A consultation had been undertaken and the pool of candidates had been widened to include other groups in the medical profession and other health professions. The new policy was more inclusive as a result to better reflect HYMS values.
- An amendment was suggested that in paragraphs 7.2 and 7.3 it be made clear that the differing route for withdrawal or suspension depended on the seniority of the title in question.

**M23-24/14 MB BS Chair’s action report and action plan**

The MB BS Programme Director presented the report (HJSC.23-24.07b/i). The report would include an updated Action Plan at subsequent meetings. The action plan last year had been extensive and actions would be more focused going forward. Outstanding actions included matters such as assessment, student communications, the academic leadership capacity of the MB BS, and process mapping.

**M23-24/15 Postgraduate Chair’s Report and Action Plan**

The Chair of the Postgraduate Taught (PGT) Board presented the report (HJSC.23-24.07b/ii). The Postgraduate Board had been split into a PGT Board and a Postgraduate Research Board (PGR Board). At subsequent meetings there would be a separate report for each Board. Taught postgraduate student numbers had decreased this year, which the Board was exploring. Items from the Action Plan were being implemented next year.

The Committee discussed the following points:

- Where postgraduate programmes had seen sustained decreased student numbers, the student experience could be affected. Programmes with small numbers would be reviewed. The issue was currently mitigated by programmes such as the MSc Pharmacology and Education sharing modules with other programmes. Strengthening CPD provision would also increase student numbers on individual modules that form postgraduate programmes. There was not currently a lower limit for student numbers on a module; withdrawal of modules would also affect the student experience.
- There had been a reduction in intercalating students taking MSc programmes. This could be due to changing entry points and financial barriers, particularly for students under the HYMS bursary. Competitors had also closed programmes. The PGT Board was exploring student motivations for intercalation and how to market programmes more effectively.
- Programmes with low student numbers could be identified through the recruitment cycle before offers are made, though this would need to take into account the complexity of the application process for medical students.
ACTION: Simon Calaminus to discuss with University of Hull and University of York Marketing Teams about managing offers for postgraduate programmes with low recruitment.

- The Physician Associate programme was recruiting well but it was noted that there were more female than male students. There was no gender bias in the application process but the programme may be more attractive to female students. This reflected a national trend.

ACTION: Simon Calaminus to add context about gender balance to the Postgraduate Taught report.
ACTION: Nadine Smith to discuss with the Hull York Medical School marketing team to ensure that marketing materials for the Physician Associate programme contained no gender bias.

- It was clarified that regardless of formatting, all actions marked as ‘complete’ in the Action plan were complete.

ACTION: Simon Calaminus to correct items marked as ‘yes’ to ‘in progress’

M23-24/16 Codes of Practice, Policies and Regulations

The Committee received a tracker of revisions to Codes of Practice, Policies and Regulations (HJSC.23-24.08). There was only one minor change to note - student representative membership of the Student Fitness to Practise Committee had been reduced from 12 to 10 for more efficiency.

M23-24/17 Annual Report of the Case Management Group, Student Fitness-to-Practise Committee and Academic Cases Committee

The Committee discussed the Annual Report of the Case Management Group (CMG), Student Fitness-to-Practise Committee (SFTP) and Academic Cases Committee (ACC) 2021-22 (HJSC.23-24.09), introduced by the Chair of Board of Studies (CBoS). The report provided assurance that the School has continued to meet its obligations to ensure that the fitness to practise, academic progress and fitness to study of all students remains fair, robust and fit for purpose.

The Committee discussed the following points:

- Offering meetings with the Chair and Secretary of CMB in responses to lower-level concerns has worked well.
- There had been a marked increase in expressions of concern over the last 2 years. This could be due to a positive culture shift in increasing staff and student awareness of supportive measures.
- Data on protected characteristics were not available so related inferences could not be made.
- There had been no PGR cases in 2022-23. Any concerns about PGR students’ academic or clinical studies would be taken to the PGR Board, and students with a clinical background would also be subject to appropriate processes.

M23-24/18 Dates of meetings in 2023-24

- Thurs 25th January 2024, 10-12pm - ALL in person at HULL
- Weds 17th April 2024 10-12pm - ALL in person at YORK
- Weds 26th June 2024 10-12pm - in person for each contingent in Hull and York respectively, linking between the two locations via Zoom
ANNEX A: Attendees of the Unreserved Agenda

Members
Becky Huxley-Binns (Chair, PVC, Education, Hull)
Tracy Lightfoot (Deputy Chair, PVC, Teaching, Learning and Students, York)
Lesley Morrell (University of Hull Senate representative)
Julie Castronovo (University of Hull Senate representative)
Matthew Perry (University of York Teaching Committee representative)
Steve King (University of York Teaching Committee representative)
Chris Wilcox (University of Hull Student Experience, Employability and Engagement Committee representative)
Helen Fenwick (University of Hull Education Committee representative)
Marjan van der Woude (Chair Postgraduate Research Board, HYMS)
Peter Bazira (Chair of the Board of Studies, HYMS)
Paul Pryor (Deputy Chair of the Board of Studies, HYMS)
Simon Calaminus (Chair, Postgraduate Taught Board, HYMS)
Nadine Smith (Chief Operating Officer, HYMS)
Chloe Fenton (President of Education, Hull University Student Union)*
Cytherea Shen* (The Vice President (Academic), University of York Graduate Students’ Association )
Marek Sadowski (HYMS Hull Lead / HYMS Students’ Officer, HUSU)*
Amelia Doherty (Academic Officer, YUSU)*

In attendance
Lucy Ambrose (Director of MBBS)
Lisa Tees (Academic Quality Manager, University of Hull)
Claire Hughes (Associate Dean (Teaching, Learning and Students), Faculty of Sciences, University of York)
Marika Kullberg (Academic Lead for Programme Quality Assurance, HYMS)
Amy Muckersie (University of York Academic Quality Manager / Secretary)
Claire Pinder (University of York Academic Quality Administration Coordinator / Assistant Secretary)

Apologies
Caroline Chaffer (University of York Senate representative)
Una MacLeod (Dean of HYMS)
Matt Morgan (Deputy Dean of HYMS)
Deborah Robinson (Interim Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Hull)
Niamh McBride (Student Chair, Student Staff Committee)*
Sarah Mahmood / Amber Lidster (Deputy Student Chairs, SSC)*
Pierrick Roger (YUSU President)*
Mardan Nasier (York President of GSA)*

*Members marked with a * do not attend for reserved business.

ANNEX B: HYMS Policy on Students Visiting Patients at Home - Revised wording

Original wording:
6.4 Students should give staff a pre-agreed ‘secret code word’ which if the student mentions on the telephone whilst on a visit will signify they feel they are in danger.

Proposed wording:
6.4 Students should give staff a pre-agreed ‘secret code word’ which if the student mentions on the telephone whilst on a visit will signify they feel they are in danger. HYMS requires GP practices to have internal Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) in place to deal with such situations. HYMS will have internal processes to ensure that GP practices put their SOP in place.
ANNEX C: New colleagues starting in HYMS:

University of Hull:

Joseph Clark, Lecturer in Global Palliative Care
Samantha Bell, Mortuary Manager
Rebecca Stevenson, Teaching Fellow in Forensic Science, Biomed
Julie Walabyeki, Lecturer in Primary Care
Helene Elliott-Button, Research Associate
Anu Ekanayake, Teaching Fellow in Biomedical Sciences
Snehal Kadam, Teaching Fellow in Biomedical Sciences
Sarah Boyes, Deputy Director MSc in PA Studies
Myriam Dell'Olio, Lecturer in Primary Care
Paul Hiebert, Lecturer in Wound Healing
Laura Simms, Data Manager
Justine Krygier, Researcher - SUPPORTED Study
Eleisha Atkin, Lecturer in Physician Associate (PA) Studies and PA in General Practice
Olapeju Bolanle, Teaching Fellow in Biomedical Sciences
Emily Holmes, Clinical Educational Facilitator (MSc in Physician Associate Studies)
William (Will) Townend, Clinical Educational Facilitator (MSc in Physician Associate Studies)
Frankie Dunn, Prosection Technician and Teaching Coordinator
Joe Cuthbert, Senior Lecturer in Cardiology and Hon Consultant in Cardiology
Cecilia Pompili, Clinical Senior Lecturer in Psychosocial Oncology
Charlotte Thompson, Trials Coordinator, Hull Health Trials Unit
Amin Ardestani, Senior Lecturer in Metabolic Signalling

University of York:

Jo Hutchings, Postgraduate Research Administrator
Martin Lyon, Finance Assistant
Theano Pavlidou, Institute of Mental Health at York (IMRY) Comms Coordinator and Administrator
Claire Warrington, Research Fellow
Molly Hope, Project Administrator
Richard Bodington, Clinical Research Fellow and Educator
Martin George, Project Office Manager (Maternity Cover)
Liina Mansukoski, Lecturer in Public Health Nutrition
Zivarna Murphy, Research Associate
Kim Robinson, Lecturer in Skin Research
Laura Beer, Research Institute Manager
Caitriona Dennis, Lecturer in Medical Education
Maca Munoz-Tapia, Programme Assistant
Sarah Clausen, Executive Support Officer
Michael Porter, Senior Lecturer in Biomedical Sciences & Medical Education (Phase 1 Lead)
Tim Green, Senior Lecturer in Biomedical Sciences & Medical Education (ALS Team lead in Curriculum Mapping)
Charlotte Plunkett-Jones, Technician
Nadine Smith, Chief Operating Officer
Charlotte Dean-Knight, Project Manager
Jeff Barber, Senior Infrastructure Engineer