

The Politics of Visual Translations of Jerusalem

INTERNATIONAL
CONFERENCE
20-21 March 2015
Berrick Saul Building
University of York

ABSTRACTS

Jane Chick (University of East Anglia)

Presenting Jerusalem: Monza and Bobbio Reconsidered

This paper focuses on the collections of sixth-century pewter ampullae in Monza and Bobbio in northern Italy. The ampullae are embellished with thematic representations of biblical events and loca sancta at which those events took place. They have traditionally been dealt with in much the same way as terracotta flasks mass-produced for the pilgrim market. This paper argues, however, that the imagery on the ampullae is not incontrovertible evidence that the artefacts were made in Palestine and that, rather than arriving in Lombardy as pilgrim eulogiai which validated personal narratives of travel, they were commissioned and manufactured in Italy as elite artefacts. In other words, they had little more than a tangential connection with the practical side of pilgrimage.

According to tradition, the ampullae were gifted as a single collection to Queen Theodolinda by Pope Gregory the Great. The bequest, a gesture of appreciation for the leading role played by Theodolinda in promoting Nicene Christianity to a position of primacy in Italy, established a powerful affiliation between the papacy and the Lombard royal house. Subsequently, the ampullae were endowed to the cathedral at Monza and the monastery of San Columbanus at Bobbio - an action which both emulated Gregory's gift-giving and promoted Theodolinda's royal status. Individually, then, the ampullae appear as artefacts of popular culture - the imagery referencing an actual penitential journey. As a collection of elite objects, however, their significance is altered and they constitute a powerful political tool. The imagery and sacred contents of the flasks provide a tangible link with Christendom's premier pilgrim itinerary which, on the one hand, constructs a kind of 'armchair pilgrimage', allowing viewers a vicarious experience of the loca sancta of Palestine, while, on the other, evoking the Holy Land in Italy and constructing a substantive link between Lombardy, Rome and Jerusalem.

Cathleen A. Fleck (Saint Louis University)

Symbols of Hegemony: Jerusalem on a Crusader Pilaster

A pilaster, or square column, represents three buildings in a rare depiction of specific Jerusalem buildings in relief: the Dome of the Rock, the *porta David*, and the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem. This piece is currently to the right of the entrance to Sultan Hassan's mosque-madrassa-mausoleum (beg. 1356) in Cairo—though Zehava Jacoby has argued for the pilaster's creation in the Holy Land and move to Cairo under the Mamluks. The uncommon nature of these three representations suggests a special Christian 'Crusader' meaning in their production, while the combination of the same three buildings also on royal Crusader seals suggests that the pilaster's original patron had official connections. This paper will propose that the pilaster could have originated in Jerusalem before the loss of the city in 1187 to the Ayyubids as symbols of Crusader hegemony—as opposed to Jacoby's suggestion that it was made in Acre, after 1191 when the Crusaders established it as a new capital, as a remembrance of the Christian loss of these sites. Comparing representations of other similar buildings for their derivations, meanings, placement, and functions sheds light on the pilaster as more probably located in Jerusalem, while analysis of the Crusader liturgies affirms the linkage among these three sites. One suggestion is that the pilaster was once on the new palace façade or in a cloister on the Temple Mount as an affirmation of the leading political and liturgical roles of the represented buildings in the Crusader city.

Elisabeth Ruchaud (Institut Catholique de Paris)

Envisioning the Anastasis: mnemonic and political reconstruction of the holy sites

The aim of this paper will be to analyse the vision of Jerusalem, and especially of the Anastasis Rotunda, as the *umbilicus mundi* and its architectural and liturgical representations in the West as a mnemonic performance and a "lieu de mémoire" during the Romanesque and till the beginning of the thirteenth century.

Based on the analysis of primarily two major medieval examples (Villeneuve d'Aveyron and Gernrode), this paper will focus on the material and immaterial symbolism of Jerusalem and the western sites. Through the pilgrimage accounts, which provide multiple informations concerning the monument and its perceptions and liturgy, I would like to underline the construction of those architectural copies as a mnemonic performance of the original site in Jerusalem. The construction of a church dedicated to the Holy Sepulchre and the introduction of a specific liturgy re-enacting the Passion and Resurrection of Christ testify of the importance of the idea (and the ideal) of Jerusalem. I would like to emphasize here the notion of "*Memoria*" at the core of those constructions and then see how those links between the (heavenly and earthly) model of Jerusalem and its copies also allow us to understand them as an exegetical and political translation beyond the pilgrimage or the monastic foundation.

The importance of the constructions linked or dedicated to the Holy Sepulchre during the Romanesque demonstrate the importance of the original architecture in the medieval thought. The development of the transubstantiation dogma in the twelfth and beginning of the thirteenth century operate a change in the perception of the Eucharist and therefore profoundly modifies the perception of the Holy Sepulchre as a relic. The main focus passes from the site of the Resurrection to the corpse of Christ himself. It therefore modifies the perception of the Holy sites and we can notice a transfer from the Anastasis Rotunda

(reliquary of the Resurrection) to the relics of the Passion as a mnemonic and political interest.

Catherine E. Hundley (University of Virginia/Warburg Institute)

Bringing the Anastasis Home: The Architecture and Politics of the Resurrection in Twelfth-Century England

Based upon textual evidence alone, historians have often assumed that the crusades were not a significant part of English life until the time of Richard the Lionheart (r.1189-1199). The number of documented English participants in the First and Second Crusades is indeed low in comparison with their Frankish counterparts, and the domestic politics of twelfth-century England would seem to further support this assumption of low crusade interest among the English. Yet the corpus of English round churches, built in imitation of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, indicates that the English identified closely with Jerusalem from the early days of the twelfth century. The close correlation between Western Christian control of Jerusalem and the creation of English Holy Sepulchre copies shows that the English saw themselves as co-heirs to Jerusalem, even as the number of English crusaders remained small.

While the Anastasis Rotunda was first and foremost a symbol of Jesus's resurrection, the church took on additional meaning in the crusade era. Western Christian control of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre was a stated objective of the First Crusade, which means that the sudden appearance of round churches in England simultaneously introduced religious and political signifiers within one building form. By examining the construction dates, locations, and worshipping communities of selected English round churches, I will show how personal devotion to the site of the resurrection could work in tandem with the potential political statements made by builders of English Holy Sepulchre copies. In turn, this study of the English round church movement expands traditional crusade narratives by showing that the English were heavily invested in Jerusalem from the early years of the twelfth century.

Kristin B. Aavitsland (MF Norwegian School of Theology, Oslo)

The Fight for Jerusalem in Scandinavian Village Churches (12th-13th Centuries)

In a number of Scandinavian medieval parish churches, especially in Denmark, monumental representations of horsemen and fighting knights decorate the walls of the nave, the triumphal wall or even the wall of the chancel. These frescoes, dating from the second half of the twelfth century to the first decades of the thirteenth, range from duelling knights (Lyngby, Tulstrup, probably Lisbjerg churches) to armies in combat (Ål, Skanderup, Mårslet, Højen and Skanderup churches) and siege of a walled city (Hornslet). Fragments of what may be interpreted as a similar iconography is also found in the small parish church Røldal in Norway, a popular pilgrimage site despite its distant and unavailable location. Generally taken to be secular elements in the otherwise sacred spaces, these decorations have few extant parallels in other parts of Europe, although they exhibit stylistic relations both to continental and insular painting from the same period. Scholars have suggested a possible connection between the knight friezes and the engagement of the Scandinavians in the crusades. In my contribution, I will take this suggestion further by arguing that the knight friezes in Danish and Norwegian village churches testify to what I label the 'crusader identity' of the Scandinavian aristocracy of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. A

conception of Jerusalem invested with politics was formative to this identity. Recognizing that the development of an ecclesiastical structure in the Scandinavian kingdoms coincided with the crusader period, I propose that to the newly-converted Scandinavians, Christian identity became one of warfare and expansion, in which the figure of the saintly king, the war on the infidels and the idea of the fundamental otherness of non-Christians came to play leading ideological roles. Against this background, I shall discuss the knight friezes in relation the liturgical spaces in which they occur, and the merge of political ideology and religious practice in these spaces.

Nancy Thebaut (University of Chicago)

Architectures of Absence: Holy Sepulchre Copies during the First through Third Crusades

In this paper, I consider the proliferation of Holy Sepulchre copies in eleventh and twelfth-century western Europe during the first through third Crusades (1096-1192) and how these structures variously re-presented the absent, Resurrected Christ in architectural and geopolitical terms. Of the extant churches from this period that imitate Christ's tomb, I focus my attention on the chapel of Saint Jean le Liget (Indre-et-Loire), which contains a series of early twelfth-century wall paintings (c. 1130-1140) with a strong iconographic emphasis on death and Resurrection, including an image of Christ's empty tomb. I will consider how different media participated in (or even at times disrupted) the project of making present the absent, Resurrected Christ within a replica of his tomb. How are frames, painted and architectural, used to delineate or conflate the tomb of le Liget with the tomb in Jerusalem, and are these frames given visual precedence over that which they contain? I will also query how to understand the multi-media recreation of Christ's tomb at le Liget in light of the political circumstances at its time of making. As this (and other) Holy Sepulchre chapels became in structure efficacious signs of the ur-tomb in Jerusalem, their efficacy appears to have remained intimately tied to the manifestation of Christ's momentary absence.

Achim Timmermann (University of Michigan)

Dead men walking in Jerusalem: Street furniture and the topographical imagination in the late medieval city

In my presentation I explore the use of pictorial devices in the stage-management of late medieval rituals of capital punishment. In particular I focus on the roles such images might have played in bringing about a temporary oscillation between two distinct sacrificial topographies – those namely of the fifteenth- or sixteenth-century town, with its scaffold extra muros, and of the biblical Jerusalem, with Mount Calvary looming above it. Focusing on a series of towns in the Middle Rhine, Franconia and Austria, I ask whether the deployment of certain pictures encouraged both the convicted offender and the audiences about to witness his or her gory death to experience the punishment ritual as a real-life Passion play. The images designed for these performances were sometimes mobile, portable, and miniaturized, but more often than not they were stationary and monumental and physically integrated into the urban matrix and surrounding landscape. As permanent fixtures, for example in the form of tabernacles (so-called poor sinner's crosses) marking the

execution site or the route leading toward it, they had much in common with the almost contemporary Stations of the Cross, which were likewise calibrated to transport their audiences into the narrative and geography of the biblical Passion, albeit in a more systematic, quasi-archaeological manner. My investigation will thus also probe the relationship between poor sinner's crosses and late medieval iterations of the via crucis, particularly in those cities where both types of "image trajectories" were present. It will be seen that this particular configuration often generated two rather different "Calvary sites", sometimes on the opposite ends of the urban perimeter, but that in several cases the civic execution site and the mons calvariae of the Stations of the Cross were in fact (rather uncannily) one and the same.

Betsy Bennett Purvis (University of Toronto)

Lamenting the Sepulchre: The Place of the Holy Sepulchre in Visual Rhetoric of the Renaissance Crusades

This paper discusses fifteenth-century terracotta *Lamentation* groups, such as Niccolò dell'Arca's *Lamentation* (1461-1463) made for the Confraternity of Sancta Maria della Vita in Bologna, as part of a visual propaganda apparatus that employs translations of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem. Current readings of these *Lamentation* groups largely divorce them from their function as part of a decorative complex that was understood to be a "historiated" Sepulchre shrine, referencing and replicating the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem. The theme of lament enacted by the sculpted *Lamentation* groups combined with their replicated chapel shrines of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem are a visual embodiment of fifteenth-century reincarnations of medieval crusading ideology and rhetoric, where recapturing the Holy Sepulchre re-emerged as a tried and true rhetorical commonplace in the crusading rhetoric and fervour sparked by the fall of Constantinople in 1453.

A rhetoric of impassioned and at times incendiary laments that focused on the loss of Christianity's last stronghold in the Old Latin Kingdom in the East was employed in sermons and orations, by mendicants and humanists alike, and disseminated strategically throughout the Italian peninsula to stoke the fires of both popular and princely enthusiasm for crusade. This rhetoric of lament operated on a system of metaphorical transference by which the fall of Constantinople became the final extension of the West's long-standing grievances and anxieties about Muslim incursions in the East, which were best crystallized and symbolised in the collective psyche of Western Christendom by the loss of Jerusalem and the Holy Sepulchre over a century and a half earlier.

Thus Renaissance crusade rhetoric and propaganda- oral, written, and visual- relied on emotionally charged evocations of the Holy Sepulchre and the dream of a recreation of a Christian dominated Jerusalem, underscoring the key place this city held in the Western imagination of holiness and religious hegemony.

Carla Benzan (University College London)

Stabilising the Image of Jerusalem: the politics of the local and global in Varallo's Scala Sancta

In 1608 the bishop of Novara, Carlo Bascapè, commissioned an exact replica of the Scala Santa. Based on measurements sent by a trusted colleague in Rome, the resulting double of

the famous Roman Passion relic was installed at the Sacro Monte of Varallo, a “New Jerusalem” in a remote alpine valley northwest of Milan. This paper considers the different kinds of claims made by the *translation* of the Holy Stairs in Rome under Sixtus V (1585-1590), and the *replication* of the relic by Carlo Bascapè in Varallo (c. 1608-1625). Whereas the Roman relic was carefully and deliberately relocated in the sacred geography of Rome, the replica at Varallo enabled connection to distant places of spiritual presence and papal authority. Yet this global reach was complicated when Bascapè demanded that each of the steps would be funded by a local alpine community. This paper will argue that Bascapè forged these connections in order to stabilize the identity of the Sacro Monte which was, after all, an unstable simulacrum of the Holy Land. Ultimately, the unsettling absence at the heart of pilgrimage to Varallo necessitated a stabilizing network that extended near and far.

Marianne Ritsema van Eck (University of Amsterdam)

Visualising St Francis’ possession of Jerusalem and the Holy Land during the 17th century: the instances in books by Quaresmio, Calahorra, Surius and Gonsales

Members of the Franciscan province of the Holy Land became ever more conscious of having to promote the Franciscan claim on the Holy Land during the 17th century. They did so as prolific writers within the genre of *geographia sacra*, or in the context of travelogues. My paper will look at four cases in which the Franciscan claim on the Holy Land was also explicitly visualised in the shape of a copper-plate engraving.

The Franciscan *custodia terrae sanctae* had been established in the late middle ages, and had, as the only Catholic institution present, since then taken on the role of receiving and conducting all Western pilgrims. This situation endured into early modern period, when the friars continued to receive both Catholic and Protestant travellers to their convent in Jerusalem.

By now, the *custodia* had existed for around two and half centuries, and its friars were writing its history in increasingly articulated terms, having recourse to not only classical crusade sources, but also to the life of St. Francis himself. Thus, they styled themselves rightful heirs and proprietors of Jerusalem and the Holy Land. These claims were undoubtedly uttered in the face of encroachment upon these perceived rights.

The engravings found in the work of Quaresmio, Calahorra, Surius, and Gonsales all are firmly situated in this context; however, they portray Francis’ *possessio* in very different ways, directed at different audiences, and with different political goals. My paper will consider all of these aspects, against the background of (illustrated) Franciscan Holy Land writing in general.

Bob Jobbins (University of Essex)

Entry into Jerusalem: Symbol of Triumph, Source of Conflict

When I was a correspondent in the Middle East (some years ago) it was often said that today’s political crises could be traced to the problems left unresolved at the end of the First World War when the Ottoman Empire was dismembered.

In this paper I propose to look at one particular incident in this process, the return of Jerusalem to Western control for the first time in 1200 years. I plan to discuss a

contemporary painting of this event by the official war artist, James McBey, in the light of the iconography of medieval European depictions of the Entry of Christ into Jerusalem. This scene was traditionally the opening sequence in Passion cycles and the prominence it was given also reflected its particular significance to the Crusader movement, representing both its “miraculous” success, and the subsequent aspiration to recapture that moment.

Depictions in Western art from Lorenzetti, Duccio and Giotto onwards illustrate the Christ’s Entry with stylised representations of the Jewish Temple, often in the form of the Dome of the Rock, thus appropriating both Jewish and Moslem history.

The Entry also became a key element in the liturgical calendar in the West, and its re-enactment a continuing memorial to the capture the city, a proleptic reference to the Heavenly Jerusalem, as well as a device for laying claim to the significance of Jerusalem for the city in which the ceremony was being held.

Many of these apparently medieval concerns are reflected in McBey’s painting of the meticulously choreographed Entry into Jerusalem of the British commander, General Allenby, in December 1917. But McBey’s work does not address the controversial Crusader imagery which swirled around the end of Moslem rule of the city, and which still has resonance today.

Shimrit Shriki (The Hebrew University of Jerusalem)

The Appropriation of Jerusalem Sites as Places of War Commemoration

Architectural representations of Jerusalem in Europe, such as Calvary Mountains and Ways of the Cross, often share a dynamic building history, with stations added, changed, removed or destroyed over time. Past studies of visual translations of Jerusalem mainly focussed on the historical perspective. Yet, the research of place, significance and function of these sites for modern society and our contemporaries warrants further investigation. One of the most interesting alternations of Jerusalem sites in the past decades is that related to memory and commemoration of agony, mainly of local victims of the World Wars.

The commemoration of contemporary suffering in the context of Jerusalem emulations has its roots already in the Baroque, when *Pestsäulen* (plague columns) remembering the victims of a plague were placed on the course of the replicated *Viae Dolorosa*, as if they were another station in the Way of the Cross. My interest lies at studying the modern and contemporary manifestations of this tradition. In this paper I wish to present several study cases from Austria and Germany, outlining the variety of approaches integrating modern (secular) commemoration within the context of Jerusalem sites. In this regard, Germany and Austria are particularly interesting, since they offer a large corpus of study cases. Moreover, commemorating war in the context of the Passion of Christ, the iconic form of suffering, is leading to the (problematic) identification of the soldiers as martyrs. As such, the sites are being used as tools for justification of a political agenda.

A study of the question of victimisation, combining the suffering of Christ and the suffering of the nation, is especially relevant in the case of Germany and Austria. The paper will examine the political dimension of using Jerusalem sites as memorials and introduce the relevance of these sites and their function in the popular practice of contemporary commemoration.

Laura Slater (University of York)

Jerusalem in British War Memorials

Visual translations of Jerusalem include its representation in modern war memorials. This paper explores what it meant to represent and imagine Jerusalem in the context of British war commemoration. The first part of my paper explores the depiction of Allenby's entry to Jerusalem in two parish memorial windows to the Great War, the Church of St Peter and St Paul at Swaffham in Norfolk, made in 1922 by the William Morris company, and the Church of St Mary Magdalene at Brampton in Huntingdonshire, made also in the early 1920s by the firm of C.E. Kempe. It considers the representation of the British and their new colonial subjects in these images, their references to the entente cordiale between Britain and France and their relation to an imagined medieval and Biblical past. The second part of my paper considers a 1948 memorial window in Durham Cathedral, in which Jerusalem is identified solely with the local cityscape and the recent conflict projected into an Apocalyptic rather than Christological frame of Biblical reference.

Kobi Ben-Meir (The Hebrew University of Jerusalem and The Israel Museum, Jerusalem)

Poetic and Political Line: Francis Alÿs's Green Line Project in Jerusalem

Since the early 1990's, the Mexico-city based artist Francis Alÿs explores spaces which are loaded with cultural connotations and socio-political tensions. During June 2004, he made in Jerusalem the work *The Green Line*: he walked for two days along the Green Line of Jerusalem (the cease-fire border line of 1949), while dripping green paint from a can. In light of the newly built West Bank wall, he visually reintroduced the official border of Israel, suppressed since the occupation of the West Bank in 1967. The sub-title of the work is *Sometimes Doing Something Poetic Can Become Political and Sometimes Doing Something Political Can Become Poetic*, hence, exploring the tension between absurd and incoherent poetic art – such as the painterly Jackson Pollock-style action of paint-dripping, and political statement.

Alÿs, as a secular pilgrim, explored the topography of socio-political separation rather than the hagio-topography of Jerusalem. But as part of his *Green Line* project, also painted and gilded in a few panels the landscape of Jerusalem as a contemporary earthly and ironic version of the Heavenly City.

Antony Eastmond (Courtauld Institute of Art)

Contesting Images of Jerusalem

Although Jerusalem lies at the heart of Christian belief, and although the city marks spiritual centre of the world on medieval maps, there is surprisingly little agreement among the different Christian confessions as to what the city actually represents. In this paper I will examine the different ways in which Jerusalem has been imagined, reconstructed and reinterpreted across the medieval world, ranging from England to the Caucasus. I will examine the often radically contrasting ways in which the meaning and symbolism of the city and its holy sites have been conceived.

