Module 6

Further Topics in Economic Evaluation

Module Workbook

2017 - 2018 academic year
STRUCTURE OF THE DISTANCE LEARNING PROGRAMMES

Module 1
Basic Economic Concepts

Module 2
Health Economics: Concepts and Analysis

Module 3
Introduction to Health Care Evaluation

Module 4
The Economics of Health Care Systems

Module 5
Statistics for Health Economics

Module 6
Further Topics in Economic Evaluation

Module 7
Assessing the Impact of Medical Technologies on Health

Module 8
Outcome Measurement and Valuation

Module 9
Decision Analysis for Health Technology Assessment

PG Certificate

PG Diploma

MSc
STRUCTURE OF MODULE 6: Further Topics in Economic Evaluation

- Unit 6.1: Fundamental Issues in Economic Evaluation
- Unit 6.2: Introduction to Analysis of Individual Patient Data for Economic Evaluation
- Unit 6.3: Introduction to Decision Modelling
- Unit 6.4: Heterogeneity in Economic Evaluation
- Unit 6.5: Reimbursement: Principles and Policy
Academic members of the Programme Team:

Martin Forster, Programme Leader, PG Certificate and PG Diploma in Health Economics for Health Care Professionals, Department of Economics and Related Studies
Helen Weatherly, Programme Leader, MSc in Economic Evaluation for HTA, Centre for Health Economics
Stuart Bell, Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences
Andrew Jones, Professor of Economics, Department of Economics and Related Studies
Subir Chattopadhyay, Chair, Graduate School Board, Department of Economics and Related Studies
Mark Sculpher, Professor of Health Economics, Centre for Health Economics
Matthew Taylor, Director, York Health Economics Consortium

Thanks go to the following peer reviewers for this module:

Mike Drummond, Professor, Centre for Health Economics
Martin Forster, Director, Distance Learning Programmes in Health Economics
Joanna Swaffield, Director, Graduate Programme in Health Economics
Peter West, Director, York Health Economics Consortium
Claire Rothery, Research Fellow, Centre for Health Economics
Mark Sculpher, Director of Team for Economic Evaluation and Health Technology Assessment, Centre for Health Economics
Helen Weatherly, Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Health Economics

A special thanks goes to past students for their comments on previous versions of this workbook.

This workbook is produced using \LaTeX at the Department of Economics and Related Studies, University of York. Sincere thanks to all of those who make this software and the associated packages freely available.
Contents

6 Guide to Module 6 .................................................. 1

Learning aims and objectives .................................. 1
  Learning aims ................................................... 7
  Learning objectives ........................................... 7

Credits, timing and assessed work ............................ 3

Module assessment .............................................. 4

On-line learning: Yorkshare .................................... 4

Reading .......................................................... 4

Module overview .................................................. 7

Unit 6.1 Fundamental issues in economic evaluation ....... 9
  6.1.1 Introduction ............................................. 10
  6.1.2 Methodological foundations .......................... 11
  6.1.3 The cost-effectiveness threshold: what it is and how to
       estimate it .................................................. 21
  6.1.4 Decision rules .......................................... 26
  6.1.5 Perspective and reporting .............................. 37
  6.1.6 Discounting health and costs in economic evaluation 45

Unit 6.2 Introduction to analysis of individual patient data 55
  6.2.1 Introduction ............................................. 58
  6.2.2 Dealing with sampling uncertainty in the analysis of
       patient-level cost data .................................... 58
  6.2.3 The stochastic nature of the incremental cost effective-
       ness ratio ................................................... 68
  6.2.4 Handling incomplete data in economic analysis along-
       side RCTs ................................................... 82
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit 6.3</th>
<th>Introduction to decision modelling</th>
<th>89</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Rationale for decision modelling</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>Concepts in decision modelling</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>Decision trees</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.5</td>
<td>State transition models</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.6</td>
<td>Probabilistic decision modelling</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 6.4</td>
<td>Heterogeneity in economic evaluation</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2</td>
<td>The importance of considering heterogeneity</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3</td>
<td>Different sources of heterogeneity</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4</td>
<td>Importance of the scale of measurement</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.5</td>
<td>Generalisability and transferability</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 6.5</td>
<td>Reimbursement: principles and policy</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2</td>
<td>The context for funding decisions</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3</td>
<td>Methods guidelines for economic evaluation</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.4</td>
<td>Challenges of incorporating economics in reimbursement procedures</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.5</td>
<td>Impact of using economic evaluation in reimbursement decisions</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.6</td>
<td>Relationship to pricing decisions</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.7</td>
<td>Overall impact of economic evaluation</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.8</td>
<td>Future developments</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

6.1  Cost-effectiveness of cancer detection. 29
6.2  ICERs and extended dominance. 30
6.3  Cost-effectiveness plane. 69
6.4  From cost-effectiveness plane to cost-effectiveness surface: the confidence box. 70
6.5  Cost-effectiveness plane. 74
6.6  Cost-effectiveness acceptability curve for 1000 bootstrap replications of the data in Table 6.5. 77
6.7  Example of two pathways following the use of a particular drug to illustrate the concept of expected values. 97
6.8  A simple decision tree showing chance nodes and decision nodes. 99
6.9  Decision tree showing comparison of two anti-emetic drugs: Part (a): Metoclopramide. 101
6.10 Decision tree showing comparison of two anti-emetic drugs: Part (b): Odansetron. 101
6.11 A simple Markov process involving three states. Transition probabilities for the model are shown in Table 6.12. 103
6.12 Effects of corticosteroids on all cause mortality at 28 days in patients with severe sepsis and septic shock (Annane et al, 2004). 124
6.13 Effects of corticosteroids on all cause mortality at 28 days in patients with severe sepsis and septic shock by dose of corticosteroids (Annane et al, 2004). 124
6.14 Five rules of thumb for evaluating whether a relative treatment effect observed in a sub-group is real (suggested by Yusuf et al. (1991) and reported in Wittes (2009)). 130
6.15 Coverage restrictions for eligible anticancer drugs, FDA approved 2004–2008. 163
List of Tables

6.1 Decision rules in CEA ........................................... 27
6.3 Decision rules in CEA ........................................... 30
6.4 Net benefit of options in Table 6.3 using $k = £30,000 per QALY. ...................................................... 35
6.5 Data from a hypothetical RCT ................................. 64
6.6 Bootstrap of cost data from Table 6.5 (first 10 iterations are shown) ............................................... 66
6.7 Bootstrap of QALY data from Table 6.5 (first 10 iterations are shown) Note that the same bootstrap samples are used for both the costs and QALYs. ................................. 72
6.8 Bootstrap results (first 10 iterations listed) ............... 73
6.9 Patient level incremental net monetary benefit (NMB) calculated for different k values using the data in Table 6.8 78
6.10 Handling missing cost data (complete dataset) .......... 85
6.11 Handling missing cost data (incomplete dataset) ...... 86
6.12 Transition probability matrix for the Markov process shown in Figure 6.11 ............................................. 104
6.13 Illustration of a cohort simulation for the 3-state Markov model in Figure 6.11 and Table 6.12 .......................... 107
6.14 Difference in cost-effectiveness results by subgroup 120
6.15 Summary of the NICE Reference Case for Technology Appraisals (2013) ........................................ 149
6.16 Requirements for Economic Evaluation of Drugs in Selected OECD Countries ..................................... 161
Guide to Module 6

Learning aims and objectives

This is a Level 7(M) module and is compensatable in certain circumstances. Please refer to the Programme Handbook, section 4, for full details.

Learning aims

To develop your understanding of the latest methods in economic evaluation, to apply these methods and to appraise critically published economic evaluation studies.

Learning objectives

Upon successful completion of the module you should be able to:

• Explain how the economic concepts of efficiency provide the foundations for the economic evaluation of health care technologies.

• Understand what the cost-effectiveness threshold represents and know how it might be estimated.
• Use appropriate decision rules in cost benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis, including an understanding of the importance of incremental ratios, extended dominance, net health benefits.

• Explain and discuss the rationale for discounting health benefits and costs in economic evaluation.

• Explain and discuss the methods problems associated with economic evaluation alongside randomised controlled trials (RCTs).

• Explain the alternative approaches that have been proposed to handle and to describe the various forms of uncertainty when using individual patient level data from RCTs.

• Explain the rationale for decision analytic modelling for economic evaluation and describe its terminology.

• Structure and analyse decision problems using a decision tree and Markov model.

• Explain the difference between deterministic and probabilistic analysis in decision models.

• Explain the concept of heterogeneity in the context of economic evaluation of health care technologies.

• Identify the different sources of heterogeneity in economic evaluations.

• Explain the factors in an economic evaluation which may limit generalisability of the evidence, and to consider how these may impact on the results of the analysis and methods for addressing this.

• Explain the use, impact and challenges of using economic evaluation to support funding decisions for health care technologies and how this varies between jurisdictions.

In addition to these, you should ensure you can meet the learning objectives outlined at the start of each unit.
Credits, timing and assessed work

The module is worth **20 credits** and should take approximately **200 hours** to complete over **12 weeks** of study, including the module assessment (see below). The following is a guide to the amount of time you might spend on each unit, although you are of course free to fit your study time to your own circumstances.


The two pieces of assessed work to be submitted on or before the dates detailed above are taken from exercises in the workbook and last year’s exam paper. They are:

- Assessed work piece 1: Exercise 6.7.
- Assessed work piece 2: Question 1 from the 2016-17 exam paper.

Please note that programme staff are under no obligation to mark assessed work that is submitted late. This applies to all modules.
Module assessment

The assessment for this module is by an open exam completed in week 12. The module is compensatable in certain circumstances. Please read the Programme Handbook carefully for the regulations regarding assessment and award at Postgraduate Diploma level. The exam is designed to be completed within a week alongside students’ usual activities (such as full time employment).

On-line learning: Yorkshare

The module is supported by the Yorkshare Academic Suite located at: vle.york.ac.uk

You can access this using your username and password which will be separately supplied. Exercises which should be discussed on Yorkshare are flagged in the text with the computer icon.

Reading

The main teaching materials are contained within this workbook. References to books and papers are noted in this workbook by the book icon. These may be ordered from the University of York’s library, or you might find them in your local UK Libraries Plus library. If you work in the NHS, your local professional librarian may prove helpful.

Where possible, you are advised to obtain the compulsory reading cited in the workbook well in advance of each unit.

The main text from Module 3 will also be used in this module:

In addition, the following book is supplied to you to accompany your study:


For the first edition, the full text of which is available from the University of York Library, a summary is available in the form of Appendix A of Gold et al. (1996) that is available in the Yorkshare Module 6 area. Please note that this appendix refers to chapters in Gold. Whilst you might like to read these chapters we do not consider this essential reading. The material is covered in the workbook and workbook readings.


Essential reading is marked in the text with a * either in the main body of the text or in footnotes.