## Appendix 2: Sensitivity analyses

### 2.1 Face validity, primary analyses

In each section, participants were asked: "Are you confident the answers you gave to questions reflect your views and uncertainties?" The possibilities for answers were: 'yes', 'not sure' and 'no'. The following sensitivity analyses: (A) consider only those that responded 'yes' or 'not sure', (B) consider only those that responded 'yes'.

## A. Individuals that responded 'yes' or 'not sure' to whether they were confident their answers reflected their views and uncertainties

Table 2.1A: Duration of effects, surrogacy and extrapolation - all clinical experts (only individuals that responded 'yes' or 'not sure' to whether they were confident their answers reflected their views and uncertainties).


* beyond the year of increased expenditure


## B. Individuals that responded 'yes' to whether they were confident their answers reflected their views

 and uncertaintiesTable 2.1B: Duration of effects, surrogacy and extrapolation - all clinical experts (only individuals that responded 'yes' to whether they were confident their answers reflected their views and uncertainties).

|  |  | year 1 | year 2 | year 3 | year 4 | Total additional duration (yrs)* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mode [Mean] (lower, upper bounds of the $80 \%$ credible interval) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Circulatory | mortality effects |  | 0.5 [1.5] | 0.3 [1.3] | 0.2 [1.0] | 1.7 [8.4] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | $(0.3,2.4)$ | $(0.2,2.4)$ | $(0.2,2.2)$ | $(1.1,4.2)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 0.7 [2.3] | 0.8 [3.4] | 0.6 [3.9] | 0.6 [4.7] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | $(0.5,2.7)$ | $(0.5,3.3)$ | $(0.4,3.8)$ | (0.4,4.1) | -- |
| Respiratory | mortality effects |  | 0.3 [1.7] | 0.4 [0.6] | 0.3 [0.4] | 1.0 [7.8] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | $(0.2,2.7)$ | $(0.3,1.5)$ | (0.2,1.3) | $(0.7,4.8)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 0.6 [6.7] | 0.7 [7.5] | 0.6 [7.4] | 0.6 [8.1] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | $(0.5,4.9)$ | $(0.5,5.1)$ | $(0.4,5.1)$ | $(0.5,5.4)$ | -- |
| Gastrointestinal | mortality effects |  | 0.4 [2.0] | 0.2 [1.4] | 0.2 [1.2] | 0.7 [12.2] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | $(0.3,2.9)$ | $(0.2,2.5)$ | (0.2,2.4) | $(0.5,6.4)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 0.9 [6.3] | 0.7 [10.0] | 0.7 [8.9] | 0.6 [7.2] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | $(0.6,4.5)$ | $(0.5,5.9)$ | $(0.5,5.5)$ | $(0.5,5.0)$ | -- |
| Neurological | mortality effects |  | 0.2 [1.7] | 0.1 [1.1] | 0.1 [1.0] | 0.8 [5.6] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | (0.2,2.8) | $(0.1,2.3)$ | (0.1,2.3) | $(0.5,4.3)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 0.8 [7.1] | 1.2 [4.0] | 1.1 [4.5] | 1.0 [6.4] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | $(0.6,4.8)$ | (0.8,3.1) | $(0.7,3.4)$ | $(0.7,4.4)$ | -- |
| Endocrinology | mortality effects |  | 0.4 [1.9] | 0.3 [1.3] | 0.3 [0.7] | 1.5 [7.8] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | $(0.3,2.8)$ | (0.2,2.4) | $(0.2,1.9)$ | $(1.0,4.3)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 1.2 [3.9] | 0.7 [10.1] | 1.2 [5.1] | 1.1 [5.7] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | (0.8,3.0) | $(0.5,5.9)$ | $(0.8,3.7)$ | $(0.7,4)$ | -- |
| Others with mortality | mortality effects |  | 0.4 [2.5] | 0.2 [1.5] | 0.1 [1.1] | 1.2 [8.4] |
|  | (vs. year 1) | estimable | (0.3,3.2) | $(0.2,2.6)$ | (0.1,2.4) | $(0.8,4.8)$ |
|  | surrogacy | 0.9 [5.5] | 1.2 [8.0] | 1.2 [9.1] | 1.3 [9.8] |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | (0.6,4.1) | (0.8,4.7) | $(0.8,5.0)$ | $(0.9,5.2)$ | -- |
| Mental Health | Extrapolation (vs. same year) | 0.8 [4.0] | 0.8 [3.9] | 0.8 [3.6] | 0.8 [3.1] |  |
|  |  | $(0.5,3.6)$ | $(0.5,3.6)$ | $(0.5,3.4)$ | (0.5,3.1) |  |
| Musculoskeletal |  | 1.0 [4.4] | 1.0 [3.5] | 1.0 [3.1] | 0.9 [2.9] |  |
|  |  | $(0.7,3.5)$ | $(0.7,3.1)$ | $(0.6,2.9)$ | $(0.6,2.8)$ |  |
| Others without |  | 0.8 [3.7] | 0.6 [3.5] | 0.9 [2.3] | 0.8 [2.3] |  |
| mortality |  | $(0.5,3.5)$ | $(0.4,3.5)$ | $(0.6,2.5)$ | $(0.5,2.6)$ |  |

* beyond the year of increased expenditure


### 2.2 Exploration of heterogeneity, primary analysis

Table 2.2: Duration of effects, surrogacy and extrapolation -- clinical experts from specific clinical area pooled.


* beyond the year of increased expenditure

Figure 2.1: Illustration of individual experts' fitted distributions and the pooled distributions-clinical experts



Full red lines: clinical specialists individually; full grey lines: other individual experts; full black line: all clinical experts pooled; red dashed line: clinical specialists pooled

### 2.3 Exploring heterogeneity, secondary analysis

| Group | Description of group | N |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G1 | I have no involvement in policy <br> Governmental Bodies (DH, NHSE, | 0 |
| G2 | PHE) <br> Non Departmental Public Bodies <br> and Independent Departmental | 15 |
| G3 | Expert Committees (NICE, JCVI) <br> Industry-related bodies (ABPI) | 5 |
| G5 | Patient representative <br> organisations <br> None of the above and indicated <br> other | 2 |

Table 2.3: Duration of effects, surrogacy and extrapolation - policy experts pooled by type of organisation.

|  |  | year 1 | year 2 | year 3 | year 4 | Total additional duration (yrs)* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Mode [Mean] (lower, upper bounds of the $80 \%$ credible interval) |  |  |  |  |
| Circulatory | mortality effects (vs. year 1) | estimable | G2: 0.5 [1] (0.3,2) | G2: 0.3 [1] (0.2,2) | G2: $0.2[0.8](0.1,1.8)$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { G2: } 1.5[19.2](1.5,43.6) ; \\ & \text { G3: } 5.2[9.4](3.5,17.1) ; \\ & \text { G4: } 4.8[10.2](3.2,19.7) \\ & \text { G5: } 3.3[7](2.2,13.5) \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | G3: 0.2 [2.3] (0.2,5.3) | G3: 0.3 [1] (0.2,2.1) | G3: 0.1 [0.7] (0.1,1.5) |  |
|  |  |  | G4: 0.9 [1.6] (0.6,3) | G4: 0.7 [1.2] (0.4,2.3) | G4: 0.5 [1.1] (0.4,2.2) |  |
|  |  |  | G5: 0.3 [0.6] (0.2,1.6) | G5: 0.1 [0.3] (0.1,1) | G5: $0.2[0.3](0.2,0.6)$ |  |
|  | surrogacy <br> (vs. same year) | G2: 0.3 [2.8] (0.3,6.4) | G2: 1 [2] (0.7,3.8) | G2: 0.9 [1.9] (0.6,3.6) | G2: 0.9 [1.8] (0.6,3.5) | -- |
|  |  | G3: $0.2[4](0.3,9)$ | G3: $0.2[3.5](0.3,8)$ | G3: 0.4 [4.1] (0.4,9.2) | G3: 0.5 [3.6] (0.4,8.2) |  |
|  |  | G4: 0.9 [2.3] (0.6,4.8) | G4: 0.7 [2.8] (0.5,6.1) | G4: 1.1 [1.7] (0.7,3) | G4: 1 [1.5] (0.7,2.7) |  |
|  |  | G5: 0.5 [0.8] (0.3,1.8) | G5: $0.2[0.5](0.1,1.7)$ | G5: $0.6[0.8](0.4,1.5)$ | G5: 0.6 [0.7] (0.4,1.4) |  |
| Respiratory | mortality effects (vs. year 1) | estimable | G2: 0.4 [0.9] (0.3,1.7); | G2: 0.2 [0.6] (0.2,1.3); | G2: 0.1 [0.5] (0.1,1.2) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { G2: } 0.5 \text { [14.5] }(0.7,32.2) \\ & \text { G3: } 1.2[7.5](1,16.8) ; \\ & \text { G4: } 5.1[7.7](3.4,13.2) ; \\ & \text { G5: } 1.1 \text { [1.9] (0.7,4.8) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | G3: 0.2 [1.3] (0.2,2.8); | G3: 0.2 [0.4] (0.1,0.9); | G3: $0.1[0.3](0.1,0.5)$ |  |
|  |  |  | G4: 0.7 [1.1] (0.5,1.9); | G4: 0.4 [0.8] (0.3,1.6); | G4: $0.2[0.4](0.1,0.8)$ |  |
|  |  |  | G5: 0.5 [0.9] (0.3,2.3) | G5: 0.3 [0.7] (0.2,2) | G5: 0.2 [0.7] (0.1,3.3) |  |
|  | surrogacy <br> (vs. same year) | G2: 1.2 [2.3] (0.8,4.3) | G2: 1.1 [2.2] (0.7,4.1) | G2: 0.9 [2] (0.6,3.9) | G2: 0.3 [2.4] (0.3,5.4) | -- |
|  |  | G3: 0.3 [2.9] (0.3,6.5) | G3: 0.5 [3.7] (0.4,8.4) | G3: 0.4 [3.9] (0.3,8.9) | G3: 0.4 [4.3] (0.4,9.7) |  |
|  |  | G4: 0.6 [3.1] (0.5,6.9) | G4: 0.6 [3.6] (0.5,8) | G4: 0.5 [2.9] (0.4,6.4) | G4: 0.4 [2.2] (0.3,4.8) |  |
|  |  | G5: 0.6 [1] (0.4,2.6) | G5: 0.8 [1] (0.5,2) | G5: 0.7 [0.9] (0.5,1.7) | G5: $0.5[0.6](0.3,1.3)$ |  |
| Gastrointestinal | mortality effects (vs. year 1) | estimable | G2: 0.1 [1.4] (0.1,3.1) | G2: 0.2 [1] (0.1,2.1) | G2: $0.2[0.8](0.2,1.8)$ | G2: 1.2 [18.1] (1.3,41) |
|  |  |  | G3: $0.3[3.8](0.3,8.6)$ | G3: 0.1 [2] (0.1,4.6) | G3: $0.2[2.2](0.2,5.1)$ | G3: 3.3 [10.7] $(2.3,22.5)$ |
|  |  |  | G4: 0.6 [2.7] (0.5,5.9) | G4: 0.4 [2.1] (0.3,4.7) | G4: 0.6 [1] (0.4,1.9) | G4: 4.6 [14.1] (3.2,29.3) |
|  |  |  | G5: 1.4 [2] (0.9,4.1) | G5: 1.6 [3.3] (1.1,9.9) | G5: 2.1 [5.7] (1.6,20.8) | G5: 1.7 [7.7] (1.6,36.6) |
|  | surrogacy(vs. same year) | G2: 0.6 [2.6] (0.5,5.7) | G2: 0.6 [2.7] (0.5,5.8) | G2: 0.6 [2.6] (0.4,5.7) | G2: 0.5 [2.6] (0.4,5.7) | (1.7 [7.7] $1.6,36.6)$ |
|  |  | G3: 1.1 [1.9] (0.7,3.5) | G3: 0.5 [2.7] (0.4,5.9) | G3: 0.3 [3.4] (0.3,7.8) | G3: 0.5 [2.5] (0.4,5.7) |  |
|  |  | G4: 0.6 [5.9] $(0.5,13.4)$ | G4: 0.6 [5.4] (0.5,12.2) | G4: 0.5 [4.6] (0.5,10.4) | G4: 0.4 [3.9] (0.4,8.9) |  |
|  |  | G5: 0.1 [0.5] (0.1,2.8) | G5: $0.2[0.5](0.2,1.6)$ | G5: 0.7 [0.9] (0.5,1.7) | G5: 0.4 [0.6] (0.3,1.2) |  |
| Neurological | mortality effects (vs. year 1) | estimable | G2: 0.6 [1] (0.4,1.9) | G2: 0.3 [0.8] (0.2,1.6) | G2: 0.2 [0.6] (0.1,1.4) | G2: 1.3 [18.9] (1.4,43) |
|  |  |  | G3: 0.2 [1.4] (0.2,3.1) | G3: $0.4[0.8](0.3,1.6)$ | G3: $0.2[0.8](0.1,1.7)$ | G3: 2.9 [8.4] (2,17.5) |
|  |  |  | G4: 0.9 [1.4] (0.6,2.4) | G4: 0.7 [1.3] $(0.5,2.4)$ | G4: 0.7 [1.1] (0.5,1.9) | G4: 6.2 [9.6] (4.1,16.6) |
|  |  |  | G5: 0 [0.7] (0.1,7.4) | G5: 4.7 [6.3] $(3.1,12.5)$ | G5: 7.6 [9.8] (5.1,18.7) | G5: 0.4 [6.4] (0.7,57.2) |
|  |  | G2: 1.4 [3] (0.9,5.8) | G2: 1.3 [2.5] (0.9,4.6) | G2: 1.1 [2.2] (0.7,4.1) | G2: 1 [2] (0.6,3.9) | -- |
|  | surrogacy | G3: 1.1 [3] (0.7,6.1) | G3: 0.8 [3.4] (0.6,7.5) | G3: 0.8 [3.4] (0.6,7.4) | G3: 0.8 [3.4] (0.6,7.4) |  |
|  | (vs. same year) | G4: 1.2 [3.5] (0.8,7.1) | G4: 1 [2.6] (0.7,5.1) | G4: 0.6 [3.1] (0.5,6.8) | G4: 0.5 [2.2] (0.3,4.9) |  |
|  |  | G5: 0.4 [1.1] (0.3,3.7) | G5: 1.4 [1.7] (0.9,3.2) | G5: 1.2 [1.5] (0.8,2.9) | G5: 0.9 [1.2] (0.6,2.3) |  |



* beyond the year of increased expenditure

G2: Governmental Bodies (DH, NHSE, PHE) ; G3: Non Departmental Public Bodies and Independent Departmental Expert Committees (NICE, JCVI); G4: Industry-related bodies (ABPI) ; G5: Patient representative organisations; G6: Other

Table 2.4: Quality of fit illustrated for duration of mortality effects in circulatory disease (question A1, circulatory)

| Exp | Expert's values | Lognormal |  |  | Gamma |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Fit LB | fit UB | pool of fits | Fit LB | fit UB | pool of fits |
|  |  | Mode (LB,UB) | Mode (LB,UB) | Mode (LB,UB) [Mean] | Mode (LB,UB) | Mode (LB, UB) | Mode (LB,UB) [Mean] |
| 1 | $3(2,6)$ | 3 [2,12.4] | 3 [2.1,6] | 3.4 [2.3,11.5] | 3 [2,5] | 3 [1.8,6] | 3 [1.9,5.5] |
| 2 | $6(2,10)$ | 5.1 [3.4,17.4] | 6 [4.4,10] | 6.2 [4.1,16.3] | 5.5 [2.9,20.1] | $6[4,10]$ | 4.9 [2.6,16.3] |
| 3 | $5(2,10)$ | 4.4 [2.9,15.1] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.6 [3.8,14.5] | 4.7 [2.5,17.3] | $5[3,10]$ | 4.3 [2.3,14.3] |
| 4 | $6(1,12)$ | 4.6 [3.1,15.9] | 6 [4.2,12] | 6.5 [4.4,15.8] | 5.1 [2.7,18.4] | 6 [3.6,12] | 5.2 [2.8,15.7] |
| 5 | $7(3,12)$ | 6.2 [4.1,21.4] | 7 [5.1,12] | 7.4 [4.9,19.9] | 6.7 [3.6,24.3] | 7 [4.6,12] | 5.8 [3.1,19.6] |
| 6 | $10(2,12)$ | 7.9 [5.2,27] | 10 [8.6,12] | 9 [6,24.5] | 8.6 [4.6,31.6] | 10 [8.4,12] | 7.7 [4.1,24.9] |
| 7 | $5(3,10)$ | 4.9 [3.2,16.6] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.8 [3.9,15.6] | 5 [3,10.2] | $5[3,10]$ | 5 [3,10.1] |
| 8 | $10(5,25)$ | 9.2 [6.1,31.7] | 10 [6.7,25] | 12.6 [8.5,32.2] | 9.9 [5.3,34.8] | 10 [5.6,25] | 9.5 [5.1,30.5] |
| 9 | $3(2,10)$ | 3 [2,12.4] | 3 [2,10] | 4.6 [3,13.2] | $3[2,5]$ | 3 [1.6,10] | 2.6 [1.4,8.1] |
| 10 | $3(0,10)$ | 2.1 [1.4,7.2] | $3[2,10]$ | $3.6[2.4,10]$ | 2.2 [1.3,4.9] | 3 [1.6,10] | 2 [1.1,8] |
| 11 | $1(0,2)$ | 0.7 [0.5,2.4] | 1 [0.7,2] | 1.1 [0.7,2.5] | 0.8 [0.4,2.8] | 1 [0.6,2] | 0.9 [0.5,2.5] |
| 12 | 3 (0.5,5) | 2.3 [1.5,7.9] | 3 [2.2,5] | 3 [2,7.5] | 2.5 [1.4,9.3] | $3[2,5]$ | 2.5 [1.3,7.6] |
| 13 | $3(1,10)$ | 2.5 [1.7,8.7] | $3[2,10]$ | 4 [2.7,10.7] | 2.8 [1.5,10.1] | 3 [1.6,10] | 2.9 [1.5,10] |
| 14 | $20(10,40)$ | 18.5 [12.3,63.4] | $20[14,40]$ | 22.8 [15.3,60.3] | 19.8 [10.5,70.9] | 20 [12.2,40] | 17.5 [9.3,58.4] |
| 15 | $5(2,10)$ | 4.4 [2.9,15.1] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.6 [3.8,14.5] | 4.7 [2.5,17.3] | $5[3,10]$ | 4.3 [2.3,14.3] |
| 16 | $2(1,5)$ | 1.8 [1.2,6.3] | 2 [1.3,5] | 2.5 [1.7,6.4] | 2 [1,7.1] | 2 [1.1,5] | 1.9 [1,6.2] |
| 17 | $10(1,20)$ | 7.4 [4.9,25.4] | $10[7,20]$ | 10.7 [7.3,25.6] | $8.2[4.4,30]$ | 10 [6.1,20] | 8.7 [4.7,25.7] |
| 18 | $5(3,10)$ | 4.9 [3.2,16.6] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.8 [3.9,15.6] | 5 [3,10.2] | $5[3,10]$ | 5 [3,10.1] |
| 19 | $15(10,30)$ | 15 [10,62.1] | 15 [10.5,30] | 17.1 [11.3,57.4] | 15 [10,25.1] | 15 [9.1,30] | 14.9 [9.4,27.8] |
| 20 | $1(0.5,3)$ | 0.9 [0.6,3.2] | 1 [0.7,3] | 1.4 [0.9,3.5] | 0.9 [0.5,3.7] | 1 [0.5,3] | 0.9 [0.5,3.4] |
| 21 | $5(1,10)$ | 3.9 [2.6,13.5] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.5 [3.7,13.4] | 4.3 [2.3,15.7] | $5[3,10]$ | 4.4 [2.3,13.3] |
| 22 | $15(10,25)$ | 15 [10,62.1] | 15 [11,25] | 15.5 [10.3,56] | 15 [10,25.1] | 15 [10,25] | 15 [10,25.1] |
| 23 | $15(5,20)$ | 12.7 [8.4,43.6] | 15 [12.1,20] | 14.1 [9.4,39.5] | 13.8 [7.3,50.1] | 15 [11.7,20] | 11.7 [6.2,39.5] |
| 24 | $2(0.1,2.5)$ | 1.4 [1,4.9] | 2 [1.7,2.5] | 1.8 [1.2,4.5] | 1.6 [0.9,5.8] | 2 [1.6,2.5] | 1.5 [0.8,4.7] |
| 25 | $5(2,10)$ | 4.4 [2.9,15.1] | 5 [3.5,10] | 5.6 [3.8,14.5] | 4.7 [2.5,17.3] | $5[3,10]$ | 4.3 [2.3,14.3] |
| 26 | $3(1,10)$ | 2.5 [1.7,8.7] | 3 [2,10] | 4 [2.7,10.7] | 2.8 [1.5,10.1] | 3 [1.6,10] | 2.9 [1.5,10] |
| 27 | $10(3,20)$ | 8.3 [5.5,28.5] | $10[7,20]$ | 11.1 [7.5,27.8] | $9[4.8,33]$ | 10 [6.1,20] | 8.7 [4.7,27.6] |
| 28 | $2(0.1,4)$ | $1.4[1,4.9]$ | 2 [1.4,4] | 2.1 [1.4,5] | 1.6 [0.9,5.7] | 2 [1.2,4] | 1.7 [0.9,5] |

Table 2.5: Duration of effects, surrogacy and extrapolation - all clinical experts, Gamma fit.


* beyond the year of increased expenditure

